

Received : 15 May 2023, Accepted: 25 June 2023

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.33282/rr.vx9i2.327>

## Sibte Hassan's Writing and Its Formative Influences on Pakistan's Historiography

Dr. Ayyaz Gull<sup>i</sup>, Dr. Huma Pervaiz<sup>ii</sup>, Dr. Noor Rehman<sup>iii</sup>, Dr. Nayyer Abbas<sup>iv</sup>

### Abstract

*After the creation of Pakistan 1947, the popularity of non-secular voices and capitalist ideas have been measured, largely, in term of their success in representing Pakistan as a theocratic or a capitalist state. This has led to an oversight of various secular and socialist writers such as Sibte Hassan who stood against the non-secular and capitalist forces. Sibte Hassan is omnipresent in the intellectual community of national and international scholars. In this research paper an attempt is being made to highlight Sibte Hassan biography, analysis of his writing's themes, and the impact of his writings on Pakistan historiography. In the light of political and social context, it discusses various ups and downs of his socialist, journalist, intellectual and political career. The main themes of his works such as socialist interpretation of the history of Pakistan, struggle between secularism and fundamentalism in Pakistan, feudalism, dictatorship and democracy will be discussed in detail. It also focuses on his writings which left an enormous impact on Pakistan's historiography. He is generally credited as being the man behind the dissemination of socialist ideas in Pakistan. Despite his command over English, Persian, much of his literary and non-literary writings are in Urdu. He was inspired by Karl Marx (1818-1883) and Fredrich Engle's (1820-1895) ideas which paved the way for his socialist interpretation of Pakistan's history. He had profound influence over the younger generation of Pakistan.*

**Keywords:** Sibte Hassan; Pakistan; Historiography; Socialist Ideas; History of Pakistan

The sources employed for this study mainly comprise the writings of Sibte Hassan. For biographical details, we have dependent on the newspaper articles published to pay tribute to Sibte Hassan and other literature related to socialists in Pakistan. Additional vernacular sources are also used to highlight Sibte Hassan ideas related to socialism, secularism, feudalism and democracy. In order to contextualize Sibte Hassan's thoughts related to politics, state, and society, it is important to furnish a brief biographical sketch. Most of Sibte Hassan writings which are edited by Jaffar Ahmad, Director at the Pakistan Study Centre, Karachi and published by Maktaba-e Danial Karachi, are used to demonstrate that Sibte Hassan has not been omitted altogether from Pakistani national discourse.

### Sibte Hassan: The Biographical Persona

Sibte Hassan, a socialist-intellectual, social historian, journalist, and political activist of Pakistan was born in Ambari village of *Azamgarh*, Uttar Pradesh (India) in 1916 (Farakh, 2016, p.310).<sup>1</sup> He received his early education from his hometown, did Bachelor of Arts from Allahabad University and to study Law he proceeded to Aligarh Muslim University to complete his graduation. In 1946 he left Deccan and completed M.A in Political Science from Columbia University, America. In pre-portioned period, during 1930s, Sibte

<sup>i</sup> Assistant Professor, Department of History, Government College University Lahore. Email: gullayyaz@gcu.edu.pk

<sup>ii</sup> Assistant Professor, Department of History, Government College University Lahore. Email: humapervaiz@gcu.edu.pk

<sup>iii</sup> Assistant Professor, Department of History, Government College University Lahore. Email: noorrehman@gcu.edu.pk

<sup>iv</sup> Assistant Professor, Department of History, Government College University Lahore. Email: nayyerabbas@gcu.edu.pk

Hassan emerged as socialist intellectual, progressive journalist and radical politician. The central idea of his all endeavours was Marxian perspective. He did not adopt Marxism as a dogmatic belief, but he interpreted the existing conditions through Marxian lenses (Ahmad, 2017, p.64). During his student age, he introduced himself with the ideas of socialism. In this context he writes that I learnt the basic principles of socialism from a distinguished historian Dr. K.M Ashraf (1903-1962) associated with the Communist Party of India, when British banned socialist literature in India. Sometimes, Karl Marx and Fredric Engle's book used to come secretly but it was not available to us. By the end, we had to read British philosopher and historian Bertrand Russell (1872-1970), Irish play writer and activist George Bernard Shaw (1856-1950) who were not socialist in a strict sense (Hassan, 2006, p.7).

Later, during his stay at America, he worked as correspondent for some communist papers and read Marx's essays related to British colonialism in India and the War of Independence 1857 published by New York Tribune (Hassan, 2016, pp.7-8). As an intellectual he wrote against the European imperialist designs. For instance, in 1935 when Italian dictator Benito Mussolini (1883-1945) invaded Ethiopia, Sibte Hassan published a collection of articles with Akhtar Hussain in which they condemned the occupation of Ethiopia (Ansari, 2015, p.201). He started *Naya Adab* (New Literature) in 1939 with poet and critic Ali Sardar Jafri (1912-2000) and an Indian poet Israr al-Haq Majaz (1911-1955) (Ansari, 2015, p. 403; Hussain, 2016, p.279). His early literary pieces of writing published in this magazine. He was inspired by Karl Marx's ideas, therefore, he joined Communist Party. As a journalist, after getting education from Aligarh University, he moved to Deccan and started his career with Qazi Abdul Ghaffar's newspaper *Payam* in Hyderabad (Manzar, 2016; "Sibte Hassan," 2005). He worked for *Payam*, National Herald and from 1941 to 1946 he worked as assistant editor of the CPI newspaper *Qumi Jang* (People's War). In pre-portioned period, as a politician he was the member of politburo of the CPI (Ali, 1952, pp.218-219; Ansari, 2015, pp. 309-310).

In post portioned period, he edited books for *Majlis-e Taraqqai Urdu* on classical topics which later helped young writers to understand Muslim classical writers. For the promotion of Pakistan's local *adab* (literature) in local languages, he issued '*Pakistani Adab*' in which local literature was translated into Urdu. He was of the view that all local literature is a national literature of Pakistan (Ahmad, 2017, p.66). In late 1947 he was in Europe when Communist Party of India directed him to return to Bombay. In 1948, by following CPI order, with a Marxist historian K.M Ashraf, Sibte Hassan came to Pakistan to assist Marxist ideologue and radical revolutionary Sajjad Zaheer (1899-1973). For these individuals it was the matter of party discipline to support each other for a political cause (Ansari, 2015, p.282). He was the closest associate of Sajjad Zaheer and later he was called the successor of Sajjad Zaheer (Sarwish, 2016, p.320). Like Sajjad Zaheer, until April 1951, he remained underground and used names such as Masood, Majid, or Arshad (A. Ali, 1952). Like many members of Communist Party of Pakistan, Sibte Hassan also had a North Indian *ashraf* background (K. A. Ali, 2015, p. 129).

Due to Rawalpindi Conspiracy Case, he remained in jail from 1951 to 1955. In 1954, when Communist Party of Pakistan was banned, he was the member of the party (K. A. Ali, 2015, p.22).<sup>2</sup> After the Pakistan's first military coup in 1958, he was again arrested by the General Ayyub's led government. From 1957 to 1959 in Lahore, he remained the editor of *Lail-o-Nahar*. He Also wrote for Amroz, Civil and Military Gazette and in Karachi he contributed essays for *Hurriyat* and Dawn. Before leaving to Karachi in 1960, because of the ban on his writings, he worked in a factory as a supervisor (Sadiqi, 2016, p. 251). He was one of the major rationalist historian and socialist writers in Pakistan who wrote against the voices of fundamentalism and political Islam. He was a major intellectual within the Pakistan Left movement until his death in 1986. He died because of heart attack in Bombay on 20 April 1986.

### **Context in Which Sibte Hassan emerged as an Intellectual**

There was an anti-imperialist atmosphere in 1920s and 1930s in British India. While describing the context of the establishment of *Taraqqi Pasand Tehrik* (Progressive Movement) (J. Naqvi, 2017) in 1936, Sibte Hassan

highlighted that there were various other movements such as Khilaphat Movement, Civil Disobedience Movement, Swadeshi Movement, Movements of peasants and labour. At the same time some other events like Jallianwala Bagh (1919), the hanging of Bhagat Singh (1931). Sibte Hassan described that he was inspired by the courage and defiance of the Meerut prisoners (Ansari, 2015, p.90). These movements and events paved the way for progressive, but, surprisingly, intellectuals and poets neither opposed nor favour these developments (Jamil, 1986, p.64).

British colonialism in India left deep impact on the sensibility of Sibte Hassan. In his words, “we were born scarred by slavery. There was hardly any self-respecting youth of our generation who had not personally experienced the arrogance of their British rulers and the racism of the Tommies. Sometimes forcibly expelled from first- or second-class railway compartments, sometimes earning a rebuke for entering lounge, a restaurant or a club reserved for Europeans. The scars kept alive our yearning for dignity and self respect. It was this awareness which enabled us to make the connection between our personal grief and the grief of our era.” (Ansari, 2015, p.193-194) Moreover, in 1940 he published a collection of poems, ‘*Azadi Ki Nazmin*’ (poems of freedom) which criticised British colonialism in India. The British provincial government banned the circulation of the copy of these poems (S. Naqvi, 2016, p.296).

Apart from Indian conditions, at international level some events such as the Socialist Revolution 1917, rise of dictatorship in Italy and Germany affected the political, social, and intellectual environment around Sibte Hassan. The Socialist Revolution of 1917 was an epoch-making event. Its impacts were also felt in British India. Indian intellectuals like Allama Muhammad Iqbal (1877-1938), Rabindranath Tagore (1861-1941) and Munshi Premchand (1880-1936) and later Sajjad Zaheer and Sibte Hassan described its impacts in their writings (M. Hussain, 1960, p.46). On the other hand, Mussolini attack on Ethiopia and Adolf Hitler (1889-1945) annexation of Austria influenced young intellectuals in India in a way that they started feeling the danger of popularity of fascist ideas (Hassan, 2016, pp.56-57).

### **Sibte Hassan: The Upholder of the Intellectual Tradition and His Political Vision**

There are two categories of scholars. First, who believes in the rational interpretation of settled beliefs and thoughts related to state, society, and religion. They propagate the tradition of dialogue on the basis of rationality, thus lead to modernity and secular ideas. Second, who believes in the ideas as they are and do not doubt and as a consequence fundamentalist idea becomes apparent in society. Sibte Hassan belongs to first category. He continued the intellectual tradition of Sir Syed Ahmad Khan (1817-1898) and Allama Muhammad Iqbal. After evaluating the causes of the downfall of Muslims in India, Khan gave preference to modernity over fundamentalism and tried to defend fundamentalist challenges faced by British Indian Muslims (Ahamed, 1967). Iqbal was also the follower of Khan and believed in the rational interpretation of Islam (Iqbal, 2010). He never left the reign of nationality and progressive writing, therefore, for fundamentalists and so-called modernists, the sin of Sibte Hassan was higher than Sir Syed and Muhammad Iqbal that by questioning tradition he followed it, in addition, with scientific method he tried to approve and disapprove it (Banu, 2000, pp.8-9). Sibte Hassan praised Sir Syed Ahmad Khan’s rational interpretation of Islam, Allama Muhammad Iqbal idea of Islamic revivalism, and Josh Malih Abadi’s (1898-1982) idea of superiority of mind over love. Sibte Hassan wrote a long essay in *Naya Adab* and tried to identify Iqbal’s *Falsafa-i-Shabeen* (Philosophy of an Eagle) with his hunger for power, militarist and despotic order (Ansari, 2015, p.125).

In post independence period Sibte Hassan political vision was developed as a result of his close association with Sajjad Zaheer. In 1948, Zaheer asked Sibte Hassan to recap Lenin collected works so that a fresh understanding regarding Pakistan’s politics could be articulated. The re-evaluation resulted in merely a vulgar interpretation of Lenin’s writings and suggested for radical politics (K. A. Ali, 2015, p.119). Therefore, in order to formulate his political vision, Sibte Hassan shifted his focus to Marx’s writings about modes of production and democracy. It is evident from his works especially *Battle of Ideas*, *Navid-e Fikar*, and *Ifkar-e Tazra* that he wrote extensively for the promotion of democracy in Pakistan. By following Marx

who claims unconventionally that true democracy is not possible under the capitalist economy, Sibte Hassan argued that democracy in Pakistan is meaningless until land and mode of production are under the control of few people (Hamdani, 1996, pp.54-57).

### **Sibte Hassan's Writing and Its Formative Influences on Pakistan's Historiography**

Apart from his articles in various reputed newspapers and vernacular magazines, he wrote total twelve books including one book in English. These books include *Shehr-e Nagaran*, *Mazy Ke Mazar*, *Pakistan Min Tehzeeb Ka Irtiqa*, *Musa se Marx Tak*, *Inqilab-e Iran*, *Navid-e Fikar*, *Pakistan Key Tehzibi wa Siasi Masail*, *Afkar-e Taza*, *Adab Aur Roshan Khayali*, *Marx Aur Mashriq*, *Sukhan Dar Sukhan* and *Battle of Ideas in Pakistan*. These books not only influenced the ethos and sensibility of readers but also paved the way for culture of progressive writings and clearly marked the lines between fundamentalism and modernity, feudalism and democracy, secularism and theocracy. By analysing the main themes, in this section a brief overview of Sibte Hassan's writings and its formative influences on Pakistan's historiography will be discussed.

#### ***Shehr-e Nagaran***

This book is Sibte Hassan's memoirs regarding Hyderabad, Deccan. The title which was suggested for this book was '*Shehr-e Arzoo*', but later it was changed as '*Shehr-e Nagaran*'. The first edition of this book appeared in 1967 which was published by *Anjuman-e Talba-e Qadeem Jamia Usmania*, Karachi. It is about the nostalgic feelings about the city of Deccan, Hyderabad. After Delhi, Deccan was the last silver line of Mughal rule. It was a cultural centre for Indian Muslims in which men, women, even children were familiar with Muslim's art and culture. Moreover, this work is an important literary contribution to understand the moral and intellectual evolution of Deccan. It highlights of Deccani civilizations and the beauties of the city. Sibte Hassan was also the part of the social milieu of this city about which he opined that at this place my consciousness became acquaintance of the beauty of life, and I learnt to love humanity. The memoirs of this city left an enormous impact on his later intellectual contribution in Pakistan (Hassan, 2016).

#### ***Mazi Ke Mazar*<sup>3</sup> (Tombs of the Past)**

Sibte Hassan isolation while in imprisonment at Shahi Qila (Lahore Fort) gave him an opportunity to write about the idea of creativity and evolution in Egyptian, Chinese, Babylonian, and Arian civilizations. He himself visited these civilization's museums and also collected information from experts. As compared to developed world, the discipline of anthropology had weak roots in Pakistan, therefore, considering the situation Sibte Hassan played a significant role in the promotion of anthropology in country. By writing this book he introduced Muslim society with the system of ideas, modes of production and people relations with the material worlds, of ancient societies in which people were prisoners of their ancestors' thoughts. In this book he did the complete translation of the first story of the world, 'Gilgamesh'. Moreover, by giving the reference of Muhammad Ali Jinnah's speech, Sibte Hassan opined that we are neither struggling to establish theocratic state nor our purpose is given reign of government to *ulamas* who wrongly believe that it is their divine right to run a state (Hassan, 1982, pp.7-8).

#### ***Pakistan Min Tehzeeb Ka Irtiqa* (The Evolution of Culture in Pakistan)**

The question, 'what is Pakistani culture?' became very prominent in 1970s. Sibte Hassan wrote about Pakistani culture by tracing its roots from the impact of various civilizations such as Arabs, Turks and Mughals. After the partition of Pakistan in 1971, this book appeared in 1975 at a critical juncture of Pakistan political history. The question related to 'Two Nation Theory' and the creation of Pakistan was at its highest ebb. The partition also triggered the debate over the cultural and civilizational background of Pakistan. In this context, Sibte Hassan wrote this book in which he penned down the history of common people rather rulers. He applied secular lenses to write this history and criticised those historians who wrongly linked the creation of Pakistan with the arrival of Muhammad bin Qasim in India (M. Ali, 2016, pp.30-33). Moreover, he also highlighted the local history of Indus valley. He defined that machinery, and tools are foundational

stones of any civilization and changes also takes place on the bases of these machinery and tools (Hassan Sibte, 1977, p.27). Moreover, in this book he wrote about the period from ancient India to the downfall of Mughals. According to Sibte Hassan, the main factor responsible for the downfall of Mughal dynasty, was the status of 'self-sufficient society' which did not change itself for many centuries and did pay attention to new innovations. This self-sufficient society did not bring change in machinery and tools of production, thus, no change in modes of production. There was a strong feudal system in which there was no space for change (Ibid, pp. 373-374). The arrival of British in India broke this stagnant status of 'self-sufficient society' (Ibid, p. 374). He evaluated the local history of India through the Marxian interpretation of history and highlighted the impact of the modes of production which determines the social, political and intellectual processes and the social relations in Indian society (Marx, 1976). In Indian society where modes of production did not change, there people are still attached with old ideas (Mansoor, 2016). He also tried to prove that the Subcontinent's history has been a history of the separation of politics and religion.

### ***Mosa Se Marx Tak*** (From Moses to Marx)

The scarcity of sources related to the study of socialism remained a perplexing question for Pakistan readers. Any good book on the history of socialism specially in Urdu language was not available in Pakistan. Sibte Hassan wrote *Musa se Marx Tak* to fill this gap. He traces the history of socialism from the Prophet Musa and also discusses in detail the main themes of western philosophers' writers such as Plato (d.347 BC), Thomas Moore (1478-1535), Francis Bacon (1561-1626) and role of philosophers like Montesquieu, Rousseau in the making of French revolution 1789. The main part of this book deals with the biographies of Karl Marx and Fredrich Engels and their ideas related to socialism. He produced this book in the time when there was a difficult time for the dissemination of socialist thoughts in Pakistan. It inspired many younger populations of Pakistan. It remains one of the fundamental guiding texts for many years for the students and the activists of the leftist politics in Pakistan ("From Moses to Marx: A Tribute to the Great Sibte Hassan," 2009).

### ***Inqilab-e Iran*** (The Iranian Revolution)

In this book Sibte Hassan explained the causes of Iranian Revolution 1979 in details and tried to highlight its impacts not only in Iran but also on Muslim world. By keeping in view Industrial Revolution (1760-1840), French Revolution 1789, Russian Revolution 1917 and Chinese Revolution 1966, he did not emphasis revolution as a temporary change. He understood the meaning of revolution from Karl Marx and writes that revolution is not only important to end the rule of ruling class, but revolution is also important to improve our self, to safeguard the dignity of humanity and to come out of tyranny (Hassan Sibte, 2006a, p.8). Moreover, in this book, he tried to compare and contrast the political, religious, social and cultural conditions of Iran and Pakistan (Hassan Sibte, 2006a). He critically evaluated the thirty-five years history of Iran in which politicians, *ulamas* (religious leaders), intellectuals, poets and artists, preferred to scarify their lives, but, did not compromise on their intellectual freedom. In this book he also translated the poetry of some Iranian revolutionary poets. Similarly, in Pakistan more or less situation remained the same in which intellectuals and poets did not enjoy freedom to writes whatever they wanted to express. By comparing Iranian Revolution 1979 with Russian Revolution 1917, Sibte Hassan opined that Iranian Revolution was not socialist revolution like Russian revolution, and it was also not like French Revolution 1789 which was a social revolution.

### ***Naveed-e Fikar***

This book was published during General Zia's period. During this period Pakistani society was passing through its turbulent phase in which socialist parties turned against socialism, non-secular forces were talking against secularism, and political use of Islam was on peak. In other words, fundamentalist were attempting to establish a theocratic state in Pakistan. In this context, *Naveed-e Fikar* appeared and highlighted the importance of democratic revolution, equality and emphasised on secular role of government. In Pakistan it was wrongly assumed that secularism means 'no religion'. With the help of the Encyclopaedia

Americana, Sibte Hassan tried to clarify the meaning of secularism, removed misunderstanding in Pakistani minds regarding secular ideas and reconciled it with existing social and political conditions of Pakistan (“Secularism,” n.d.).<sup>4</sup> In short, secularism remained an important topic of his intellectual endeavours. In this work he questioned the use of religion to promote fundamentalist ideas and compartmentalization of Pakistani society on the basis of sectarianism. He pointed out that feudalism is one of the main hurdles in the way of establishing democracy and nurturing freedom of thoughts in Pakistan. In this context, Hamza Alavi ideas related to military-bureaucratic oligarchy and feudalism inspired Sibte Hassan.

### ***Pakistan Key Tehzibi wa Siasi Masail* (The Civilizational and Political Problems of Pakistan)**

After the creation of Pakistan 1947, Sibte Hassan wrote for various newspapers such as *Imroz*, *Civil and Military Gazette*, *Huriyat*, *Dawn*, *Viewpoint*, and *Muslim*. But the peak of his journalist career was the period from 1957 to 1958 and from 1970 to 1971 when he worked as the editor of *Lail-o-Nabar* (Ahmad, 2017, p.8).<sup>5</sup> This work, *Pakistan Key Tehzibi wa Siasi Masail* comprised on his writings published in different editorials of Karachi based *Lail-o-Nabar* in 1974. The themes such as human rights, economic justice, people friendship, and democracy are discussed in this book. There is a great importance of these editorials with special reference to the politics, state and society in Pakistan. Ahmad Saleem, Pakistani historian has collected these editorial and edited by Jaffar Ahmad. There are four parts of this work. First part, ‘*Jambori Dor*’ (Democratic Period) 1957-1958, highlight the themes like early political history of Pakistan, political culture, Pakistan foreign policy, education, and culture and civilization background of Pakistan. Second part is the short constitutional history, social reforms, foreign policy, art and culture under Ayyub’s Martial Law, 25 January 1959 to 18 April 1959. Third part deals with Yahya’s Martial Law 1970-1971 in which affairs of election and the East Pakistan are discussed. Last part explains ‘*Naya Pakistan*’ (New Pakistan). It discusses Sibte Hassan’s editorials published in monthly magazine ‘*Pakistani Adab*’ (Pakistani literature) from 1974 to 1977. This magazine was a unique in the sense that along with Urdu it published literature almost in all local languages of Pakistan (Manzar, 2016). As a social historian, instead of writing about the changing rulers and governments, Sibte Hassan evaluated the political and social change and its impact on daily life of common people (Hassan Sibte, 2015). With the publication of ‘*Pakistan Min Tehzib Ka Irtiqā*’ the debate regarding the social conditions and stagnant society of India before the arrival of British started.

### ***Afkar-e Taza* (Fresh Thoughts)**

This book is the collection of Sibte Hassan’s essays on Urdu literature. Jaffar Ahmad edited it. The essay entitled “*Amir Khusro wa Aik Azeem Tabzibi Versa*” illustrates the various features of his personalities. The life of poets like Amir Khusro (1253-1325) is described in way that it also highlights the social and political conditions of that time (Ahmad Jaffar, 2016, p.17-18). Another essay of this work explains the biographical details and the role of Iranian old and new generations of poets for bringing Iranian Revolution 1979 (Ibid, p. 92-93). Moreover, some other essays highlights an early political history of Pakistan and the life and contributions of intellectuals such as Shah Abdul Latif Bhittai (1689-1752) , Mian Iftikhar-ud-Din (1907-1962), Ali Sardar Jafri (1913-2000), Munshi Premchand, Josh Maliha Abadi so on so forth.

### ***Marx Aur Mashriq***

Marx Aur Mashriq was the unfinished intellectual endeavours of Sibte Hassan. The ideas of Marx have many formative influences on the writing of Sibte Hassan. Therefore, Sibte Hassan separately produced a book on Marx. This book is divided into four parts. First part ‘Marx and the East’ deals with themes such as relations between East and the West, Marx and the East (before London), Marx and Eastern Mods of Production, Karl Marx and Muslim World, Lenin and Eastern Nations. Second part covers various Sibte Hassan’s essays related to socialism such as the principles of socialism, Socialism: Ideological and Practical, and Muslim world and the independence of Soviet Union. One could ask question that why he did not write about the Russian Revolution 1917 and its impact on the East. By giving answer to this question, Jaffar Ahmad opines that Sibte Hassan was eagerly intended to write on the Russian Revolution 1917 during

his last days and for this purpose he collected a variety of research material from Indian Office Library, London, but he could not write (Hassan, 2016a, p.5).

### ***Sukhan Dar Sukhan***

An ideological friendship of Sibte Hassan and revolutionary poet Faiz Ahmad Faiz (1911-1984) remained for forty years. Their ideas were not contrary to each other. The ups and down in Faiz life left a deep impact on Sibte Hassan's mind and thoughts. By reading Faiz's *Naqsh-e Fiyadi* under the streetlights of Lucknow, Sibte Hassan realized the depth of Faiz thoughts which were not the reflections of personal grief but the painful voice of Indian Muslims (Hassan, 2016c, p.9). The common thing between these intellectuals was the grief of Indian Muslims. They remained in jail together, worked under one roof for Pakistan Times, *Imroz*, *Lail-o-Nabar*, participated in *Anjamane-e Taraqi Pasand Musanfeen*. After the death of Faiz, in order to pay tribute Sibte Hassan wrote *Sukhan Dar Sukhan* which is a great source to understand Faiz ideas (Ahmad, 2017, p.61). By highlighting the context of Faiz poetry, he illustrates Faiz poems in *Naqsh-e Fiyadi* such as 'Soch' (thinking) 'Raqeeb' (rival), 'Tanhai' (Loneliness) (Hassan, 2016c, pp.14-15). He not only praised Faiz's poetry but also criticised his poems like 'Kutay' (dogs) in which Faiz used the dogs as a metaphor for people who were struggling for freedom (Hassan, 2016c, p.17). This book is a kind of Faiz's biography which contains first-hand information regarding Faiz life and describe some interesting events of Faiz. For example, once while working in military department of publication, he wore up military uniform and his days in prison with Sibte Hassan (Ibid, p.22-23). It also tells the role of Faiz in the development of culture and art through '*Alhamra*'. Moreover, this work talks about Faiz emotional breakdown because of the separation of East Pakistan and he wrote two poems such as '*Shareh-e Baidari Halat na Honin Pa?*' and '*Hazar Karo Meray Tan Se*' (Ibid, p. 74). Faiz was ready to go on self-imposed exile in 1971, but, because of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto (1928-1979) offer to do work as director of Islamabad National Council of the Arts, he decided to stay in country (Ibid, p.78). But, because of bureaucratic hurdles his dream of promoting Pakistani art and culture remained incomplete. From poetry perspective, the four years spent in Islamabad were the worst year of Faiz's poetic contribution (Ibid, p.79). The last parts of this book highlights Faiz stay at Soviet Union and his feeling for Palestine.

### ***Battle of Ideas in Pakistan***

Sibte Hassan this book is the only one in English. He is of the view that in recorded human history, there remained unending battles of ideas between ruler and ruled, exploiters and exploited, and ideological conflicts which are the representations of different mind. According to changing circumstances, society demands change, but sometimes the process of change becomes stagnant as it happened in sub-continent context where prior to western tradition, ideological differences were usually expressed in religious terms (Hassan, 1986, p.2). Moreover, he highlights the conflict between humanist and dogmatists which showed to opposite approaches towards state and society. The humanist such as Sufis echoed for the Brotherhood of Man and the Unity of Existence. In other words, there is no difference between *Khaliq* (God) and *Makbluq* (Man). They disassociated themselves from politics of religion and State. On the other hand, dogmatists such as clerics used religion as a tool to accomplish their power and social status and through doctrinal confrontations, they tried to convert state into a theocracy (Ibid, p.2). In response to British colonialism, he also describes the debate between fundamentalists and modernists to preserve Muslim identity in British India and emphasised for 'scientific socialism', secular democratic state (Ibid, p.6). The major portion of this book deals with secularism and development of secular ideas in Pakistan. He writes in the introduction of this book, "the future of the secularism in Pakistan is closely linked with the abolition of imperialist-controlled feudal social structure, represented by the comprador bourgeoisie, the big landlords, the military junta and the *mullab* (religious leader), thus building a firm base for the development of true democracy in the country." For Sibte Hassan, secularism is the basis of democracy (Shahzad Muhammad, 2016).

### **Conclusion**

From the above discussion it appears that Sibte Hassan was one of the biggest social writers and socialist interpreters. He did systematic analysis of the past. He vividly questioned the use of religion to promote fundamentalist ideas in the society. He tried to compel Muslim's minds to think critically and question things with logic and rationality. As a social historian, he highlighted different civilisations political and social institutions, norms, traditions and system of thoughts. He was a transformer of socialist and secularist ideas from old generation to new (Alavi, 2016, p.15). He neither used poetry nor fiction to express his thoughts, but, through progressive lens he wrote about the state, society, and religion. The popularity of his works could be described by the fact that his works has been published in many editions. By following Marx's theory of dialectical materialism and historical materialism, Sibte Hassan did creative interpretation of Marx ideas and did creative application of those ideas on Indian state, society and religion. He pointed out that there is a close relationship between literature and the society. The ideas discussed in literature will shape the outlook of society and the ideas which will emerge in the society would be presented by literature (Ansari Ambarin, 2018, p.151).

## References

- Ahamed, A. (1967). *Islamic Modernism in India and Pakistan: 1857-1964*. Oxford University Press.
- Ahmad, J. (2017). Sibte Hassan Key Afkar Aur Shorsh -e Amroz. *Tarikh*, 57, 64–70.
- Ahmad Jaffar. (2016). *Afkar-e Taza*. Maktaba-e Inqilab.
- Alavi, H. (2016). Sibte Hassan: Pakistan min Inqalabi Fikar ki Hayat-e Nu. In J. Ahmad (Ed.), *Sibte Hassan: Shaksyat aur Fikar* (p. 15). Maktaba-e Danial.
- Ali, A. (1952). *The Communist Party of West Pakistan in Action*. Government Printing Press.
- Ali, K. A. (2015). *Surkh Salam: Communist Politics and Class Activism in Pakistan 1947-1972* (J. Ahmad, Ed.). Oxford University Press.
- Ali, M. (2016). Sibte Hassan ki Tarikh Nawaisi. In Ahmad Jaffar (Ed.), *Sibte Hassan: Shaksyat aur Fikar* (pp. 30–33). Maktaba-e Danial.
- Ansari Ambarin. (2018). *Tariqi Pasand Tanqid Key Do Aham Mamar*. Karachi University.
- Ansari, K. H. (2015). *The Emergence of Socialist Thought among North Indian Muslims (1917-1947)*. 201.
- Banu, B. (2000). *Faiẓ Ahmad Faiẓ Ki Urdu Sahafat*. Pakistan Studies Centre, Karachi University.
- Farakh, S. (2016). Syed Sibte Hassan: Sher-e Nagaran ka Musafir. In S. J. Ahmed (Ed.), *Sibte Hasan: Shaksyat Aur Fikar* (pp. 310–325). Maktaba Daniyal.
- From Moses to Marx: A Tribute to the Great Sibte Hassan. (2009). In *Pak Tea House*.
- Hamdani, A. (1996). *Naey Rang Naey Dhang*. Saap Publications.
- Hassan, S. (1982). *Mazj Key Mazjar*. Maktaba-e Danial.
- Hassan, S. (1986). *The Battle of Ideas in Pakistan*. Pakistan Publishing House.
- Hassan, S. (2016a). *Marx Aur Mashriq* (Jaffar Ahmad, Ed.). Maktaba-e Danial.
- Hassan, S. (2016b). *Shehr-e Nagaran*. Maktaba-e Danial.
- Hassan, S. (2016c). *Sukhan Dar Sukhan* (3rd ed.). Maktaba-e Danial.

- Hassan Sibte. (1977). *Pakistan Min Tabzib ka Irtiqa*. Maktaba-e Danial.
- Hassan Sibte. (2006a). *Inqalab-e Iran*. Maktaba-e Danial.
- Hassan Sibte. (2006b). *Musa se Marx Tak*. Maktaba Daniyal.
- Hassan Sibte. (2015). *Pakistan Key Tehzibi wa Siasi Masail*. Maktaba-e Inqilab.
- Hussain, F. (2016). Sibte Hassan: Aik Tasur. In J. Ahmad (Ed.), *Sibte Hassan: Shaksiyat aur Fikar* (p. 279). Maktaba-e Danial.
- Hussain, M. (1960). *Adab Aur Shaoor*. Urdu Academy.
- Iqbal, M. (2010). *The Reconstruction of Religious Thoughts in Islam*. Sang-e-Meel Publication.
- Jamil, M. (1986). *Gujfago*. Maktaba-e Danial.
- Mansoor, M. (2016, November 20). Sibte Hassan ki Yad Min. *Express News*.
- Manzar, S. (2016). Sibte Hassan. In Ahmad Jaffar (Ed.), *Sibte Hassan: Shaksiyat aur Fikar* (p. 86). Maktaba-e Danial.
- Marx, K. (1976). The British Rule in India. In M. Engels (Ed.), *On Colonialism*. Progress Publishers.
- Naqvi, J. (2017). *Taraqi Pasand Urdu Nasar Key Pachas Sal*. Peace Publications.
- Naqvi, S. (2016). Sibte Bhai. In J. Ahmad (Ed.), *Sibte Hassan: Shaksiyat aur Fikar* (p. 296). Maktaba-e Danial.
- Sadiqi, S. (2016). Syed Sibte Hassan Bahot Achay Admi Thay, Bahot Baray Admi Thay. In J. Ahmad (Ed.), *Sibte Hassan: Shaksiyat aur Fikar* (p. 251). Maktaba-e Danial.
- Sarwish, R. (2016). Syed Sibte Hassan: Kuch Yadin. In J. Ahmad (Ed.), *Sibte Hassan: Shaksiyat aur Fikar* (p. 320). Maktaba-e Danial.
- Secularism. (n.d.). In *Encyclopedia Americana* (p. 521).
- Shahzad Muhammad. (2016, November 20). Faiz Festival: Tribute Paid to Sibte Hassan. *The Express Tribune*.
- Sibte Hassan. (2005, April 6). *Dawn*.

## Notes

<sup>1</sup> Some people called him 'Sibte Sahib', many called him 'Syed Sahib', but his admirer called him 'Sibte Bhai'.

<sup>2</sup> The Communist Party of Pakistan was established by dividing the Communist Party of India during its Calcutta Conference in February-March 1948.

<sup>3</sup> First published in 1969. Sibte Hassan had a plan to publish three volumes on *The Impact of Eastern Thoughts*, but unluckily he could publish only first volume with *Mazqi Key Mazhar*.

<sup>4</sup> According to the Encyclopaedia Americana, secularism is a moral system which based on natural moral ideas and it is beyond divine religion.

<sup>5</sup> From 1957 to 1959 Lail-o-Nahar was published from Lahore and from 1970 to 1971 it appeared from Karachi.