

Received : 25 July 2024, Accepted: 18 September 2024
DOI: <https://doi.org/10.33282/rr.vx9i2.62>

Investigation of Panoptical Surveillance in Kazuo Ishiguro's *Never Let Me Go.*

¹Ammara Mehmood, ²Saira Batool, ³Ghulam Murtaza,
⁴Aliza Zahra

1. Lecturer, Department of English, University of Jhang, Jhang, Punjab, Pakistan (Corresponding Author)

Email: ammarabharwana222@gmail.com

2. Department of English, PakTurk Maarif International Schools and Colleges, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan. Email: s.saira@gmail.com

3. Principal, United College, Sultan Bahoo, Jhang, Punjab, Pakistan Ghulammurtaza8989@gmail.com

4. Lecturer, Department of English, Millat College Jhang, Punjab, Pakistan Email: alizaaazahra@gmail.com

Abstract

This study is designed to explore Panoptical Surveillance in *Never Let Me Go* (2005) by the most proficient British author Kazuo Ishiguro. The term panopticon denotes a modification of behavior through the experimental laboratory of power, and French philosopher Michel Foucault beheld the panopticon as a mark of the social order of surveillance. Ishiguro builds a panoptic state of surveillance, transmuting an otherwise non-urban space into a pseudo-cityscape. In the story related to clones; *Never Let Me Go*, clones are created and sustained with the idea that they will one day substitute organs to humans. The clones are kept and raised in an educational boarding school, like Hailsham, residing there. they never completely learn about their structure and the purpose of existence. The aim of this research is to unveil the life of clones within the panoptic

environment where students are constantly been observed with the physical place around them. The results show power relation with panopticon society of Hailsham in the novel, a number of factors are involved for Hailsham and recovery center being the greatest cradle of power, for some time period the human clones are the objects that are portrayed as the most defenseless bodies. The significance of this research is close observation of clone people. Significance lies in unmasking nature of latest scientific invention for betterment of society, another mask of power and domination through surveillance technologies. In this novel, panopticon is Hailsham and surveillance on students of Hailsham. This piece of writing is of qualitative in nature. MLA 2008 format is used in this research.

Keywords: Panopticon, Surveillance, Bio Power, resistance, power dominance, subjugation

Introduction

This study aims at highlight the panoptical surveillance aspects through power dominance, bio power, resistance and power of authority over institution etc. British writer *Kazuo Ishiguro's* dystopian science fiction novel *Never Let Me Go* (2005) is selected for the textual analysis of panoptical surveillance. It throws light on the influence of nature of power in society as well as influence on the novel's characters. It illustrates that, how Ishiguro has tried to expose the powerful, strong and intense effects of surveillance and disciplinary power upon the clones of Hailsham. This panopticism is depicted through the characters Tommy, Ruth and Kathy H. Kathy, a clone, which narrate the whole story and remember all past incidence of her institution Hailsham. This research has shown how Ishiguro's characters intentionally and purposefully accept their faith as a clone and how their life, style, language, behavior, thoughts, and mind echo the power dominance society. This research also depicts the ethics of ownership surrounding the creation of cloned life in kazuo Ishiguro's *Never Let Me Go*. The current study focuses on the concepts and theories of French social theorist and literary critic Michel Foucault. Panoptical surveillance is used as a prominent device by Ishiguro's *Never Let Me Go*. This study provides the new dimension to the comprehension and conception of Ishiguro's work with respect to the use of tool of panoptical surveillance. This topic can be adopted by researchers in future for about power dominance exhibited by Ishiguro with respect to panoptical surveillance as well.

An English writer Ishiguro was born on 8 November, 1954. Ishiguro, a Japanese born British novelist and one of the most celebrated contemporary fiction writers in the English Speaking World. He devoted himself to drama and historical fiction. Through his novels, screenplays and short stories, he proved himself one of the most proficient, celebrated and finest contemporary fiction writers of his generation. Ishiguro's work has been translated into forty languages and has won him many honors, including the booker prize, the Order of the British Empire for service to literature, and the French decoration

Chevalier de l'Order des Arts et des Letters. In 2017, he was awarded Nobel Prize in literature.

Ishiguro uses appreciate and sophistication language and he use proportionate care and correctness in his management of words. There is also incorporeal perfection to his writing. Irrespective of the story he is telling, there is also a poetic sensibility in his work. Ishiguro's novels are omniscient narrated because it allows his characters to reveals the imperfection, blemishes, defects, errors and human flaws indirectly.

The first two novels of Kazuo Ishiguro are *A Pale View of Hills* (1982) and *An Artist of the Floating World* (1986), which examine the changes in Japanese society since the war. It also serves as mournful novels of memory, guilt, mistakes and responsibility for their faults. Tone of his novels is unique and pursuing. The creativity in storytelling and imagination, can create a pure fictitious novel. Ishiguro's novel *The Unconsoled* (1995) was bold and overwhelming work of speculative fiction that receives a fair share of critical mockery. His next novel *When We Were Orphans* (2000) is far less rebellions and a minor work. Ishiguro's latest novel *The Buried Giant* (2015) which dip into the science fiction and fantasy categories.

Never Let Me Go is a novel about clones, the main character or protagonist of the novel is Kathy, Tommy and Ruth. These protagonists accept their fate as human clones that are utilized for the donation their organs to standard human beings. The process of transplantation creates a lot of agony, endless pain and death at the end. The narrator of the story is Kathy, who unfolds the story with a bit of suspense. Kathy reminiscences her childhood in Hailsham, a superficially remote boarding school in England. In this boarding school, students live and study. These students do not learn the life skills but they are trained to keep themselves healthy and to display many forms of art.

It describes the devastating novel of innocence, knowledge, and loss. As children, Kathy, Ruth, and Tommy were students at Hailsham, an elite boarding school isolated in the English countryside. It was a place of unpredictable sets and mysterious rules. Teachers were constantly reminding their charges of how special they were. Ishiguro's

works deal with social issues, class, gender issues, ethics, morals and nationhood. Ishiguro also focuses on the surrounding imaginative and creative depiction. His dire science fiction novel *Never Let Me Go* short listed for booker prize stated his admire career in fiction and artistic contemporaries. Ishiguro describes an imaginative boarding school where clones are students. The novel is reminiscent in nature as major portion of this book consists of childhood memory and pessimistic life of clones in Hailsham. This novel has futuristic tone and the setting is England, late 1990s. It is a story about clones and carers. The clones are the representation of artificial humans and posthuman bodies. The thirty-one year old Kathy H narrated her story. She narrate the story of her arrival at Hailsham, students of Hailsham are clones and how the cloning technique is used to donate human organs of healthy person to save the life and health of other members of society. It shows the immorality and show that high cost of lives is wasted for wrong people.

Ishiguro used the scientific technique of cloning in this novel. Ishiguro describes in his novel, that these clones have no rights in making decision about their lives. They are under the power of their institution, they are controlled by state Hailsham. These clones are hopeless and they silently accept their faith as an organ donator, as a clone and as a carer. The environment provided by these clones is not different from the normal human beings.

Panopticon is a concept of a philosopher Jeremy Bentham. The Panopticon and panoptic theory has been used throughout history to help the empowered control population and modify their behaviors. Michel Foucault revitalized interest in Panopticon and used the Panopticon as a way to illustrate the tendency of disciplinary societies subjugated its citizens. Specifying for the Foucault, Bentham's masterpiece was indeed a metaphor for a surveillance society which main scope is to control, observe and reform its residents. Surveillance is a phenomenon that has affected generations in many ways. The base of surveillance is fear of constant supervision and invisible eye. In elaborating this concept, Foucault does not take deep measures to elucidate the relationship that the clones created in Ishiguro's novel maintain with an actual physical place available around

them. Panopticon is centrally inspected by CCTV, requirement of round building is null. The idea of monitoring the electronic communications from a central hub, is the base of Panopticon. The real essence of panoptical surveillance concept is that there are several activities which proves better results while conducted under supervision.

1.1 Research Objective:

The research objectives of study are;

- 1.1.1 To explore the panoptical surveillance in *Never Let Me Go*.
- 1.1.2 To discover the idea of clone as institutional technology of panoptical surveillance in *Never Let Me Go*.
- 1.1.3 To study the ethics of clone's life with reference to panoptical surveillance in Ishiguro's *Never Let Me Go*.

1.2 Research Questions:

- 1.2.1 To explore the panoptical surveillance in *Never Let Me Go*?
- 1.2.2 To discover the idea of clone as institutional technology of panoptical surveillance in *Never Let Me Go*?
- 1.2.3 To study the ethics of clone's life with reference to panoptical surveillance in Ishiguro's *Never Let Me Go*?

1.3 Significance of the study

This study aims to highlight that this humanitarian approach of cloning is nothing but a technological panoptical surveillance tool in this modern world. This study focuses on the panopticon Hailsham society with special emphasis on the protagonist of the novel Kathy and her friends to expose the technological subjugative surveillance.

Literature Review

This chapter highlights literature review regarding British socialist Ishiguro, his novel *Never Let Me Go*, and panoptical surveillance an instrument for study of power dominance within the clones of Hailsham. French literary critic Michel Foucault (1975) claims “the major effect of the Panopticon: to induce in the inmate a state of conscious and permanent visibility that assures the automatic functioning of power” (*Discipline and Punish* 201). In the said work, Foucault describes supremacy of power through the deception of visibility. This article focuses on the kind of surveillance, in which activities of clones are under the observation of their authority.

Ishiguro has not written the novel with the intention of representing a discussion of the ethical justifications of human cloning but the story inherently raises the philosophical question of whether the clones can be defined as human. McDonald (2007) in “*Days of Past Future: Kazuo Ishiguro’s Never Let Me Go as Speculative Memoir*” defends Kathy’s humanness by describing the human world as one that goes so far as to disenfranchise her from the human mass. On the other hand, Menand (2005) in “*Something About Kathy*”, notices something ‘animatronic’ about them. If a human like physicality and an emotional and intellectual faculty do not sufficiently prove humanness, in the novel the Hailsham teachers try to show that the clones are in no way ‘less than fully human’ (p. 256) by showcasing their artistic talents.

In the article “*Human Cloning as the Other in Ishiguro’s Never Let Me Go*” (2015), Wen Guo scrutinizes Kazuo Ishiguro's concept in novel focusing on Ishiguro's depiction of correlation between human replicas and people with marginal freedom in modern societies. Guo debates about the overall atmosphere of doubt and suspense in the novel and expounds about the dealing of theme of otherness by Ishiguro's core mock-realism in the setting of a science fiction. Further, Guo questions the “unhomely” Hailsham, the struggle of self-pursuit by the clones, and their ethical values and behaviours. Guo maintains that in Ishiguro’s novel, it is established that an individual's ethical choices are the resolute of his/her surrounding and situation. This observation validates Ishiguro’s beliefs regarding a person's sense of responsibility, fidelity, and destiny based on his/her ethical decisions.

Marcelo Hoffman’s essay “*Disciplinary Power*” (2011), he offers a digestible overview of Foucault’s disciplinary model, which he introduces as “produc(ing) an organic individuality by exerting control over bodily activities” (Hoffman, p. 29). In disciplinary power, Foucault breaks down people to the idea of “bodies”, where in people are subjected to the modalities of power and become part of the disciplinary system.

The novel under discussion *Never Let Me Go* (Ishiguro, 2005) is “a glimpse into the future whose genius will be recognized as reality catches up” (The Village of Voice). The novel comprehends post-human bodies. These clones are the presentation of destructive future. It depicts the existence of technology. It is about human clones. Ishiguro is not writing about the science of future but he is writing about the real human issue. In this novel, Kathy and her friend express no outrage against the cruel system imposed on them. They have raised voices against this authoritative system but they are subjugated by ideology of their role for the betterment of society.

In her latest article “*Unreliable Physical Places and Memories as Posthuman Narration in Ishiguro’s Never Let Me Go*” (2017), Megan E. Cannella demonstrates how the posthuman interactions of the narrator with physical spaces assist to stabilize a generally unreliable posthuman description by co-relating the concept of panopticism by

Michel Foucault with the theories Edward W. Soja presented on third space. Megan highlights the four key places contained in *Never Let Me Go* and by using the theoretical works presented by Foucault and Soja, reveals the undependable roles of such concrete places and retention. She finally comes to the conclusion that the physical places depicted in the current novel affect the unreliable.

In another significant article "*The Pieties of the Death Sentence in Kazuo Ishiguro's Never Let Me Go*" (2018). In this article the author proposes that Jacques Derrida's novel "*The Death Penalty*," actually opens up the discussion about another way to reflect at the ethics as well as the pathos of *Never Let Me Go*. His article proposes an interpretation of the novel in the light of Derrida's seminar in order to witness the development of its own logic of the demise and its counter-argument. Tink claims that another resonance exists in the novel that points towards the thought of death sentence. This resonance is conversed with the themes of art, education and creativity. However, these themes are going to be approached inversely in this study.

Keith McDonald investigates in her famous article "*Days of Past Futures: Kazuo Ishiguro's Never Let Me Go as 'Speculative Memoir'*" (2007), the angles though which the topological climaxes of autobiography are employed in the novel under study. She further examines the likely reasons and consequences of such a distinct narrative technique through a dissertation of the distinguishing autobiographical exchanges that are a prominent feature of the novel, which indicates the delimitation of schooling and the upcoming era of narrative. Additionally, she converses about the metafictional instances to the process of writing, along with the consideration of current novel as a pathography, where the infirmity of the ones cared for is provided testimony. McDonald additionally claims that in this novel, Ishiguro offers readers to forgo the cloak of genuineness for a while and witness the memoir acquired from another reality, where science-fiction yet again wakens up our creative energies to behave like a lens by which we inspect modern social dilemmas.

In his article “*Controlling Time: Kazuo Ishiguro’s Never Let Me Go*” (2009), Currie points out assured features in the narration of Kathy while analyzing the time breakup of the novel. Foremost, as demonstrated in such expressions as “I’d more or less forgotten about it when ...” (p. 13), Kathy frequently recalls happenings she claims to be forgotten for a long time period. An instance is Kathy’s portrayal of Miss Lucy getting distressed after revealing the truth to the learners: ‘After that morning I became convinced something else – perhaps something awful – lay around the corner ... What I didn’t know at the time was that something pretty substantial had happened only a few days after I’d seen her in Room (Ishiguro, p.90). The fact that Miss Lucy had been terminated is acknowledged by the mature raconteur, but not to the young Kathy, who only elusively anticipates the happening of something awful.

Homi k. Bhabha (1992) states in “*The World and the Home*” that unhomely is always present, in a distant location, and in the recollection of Kathy: “although the ‘unhomely’ is a paradigmatic post-colonial experience, it has a resonance that can be heard noticeably, if unsteadily, in fictions that exchange the powers of cultural difference in a range of historical conditions and social contradictions” (p. 142). Therefore, it can be safely said that Hailsham reverberates with Ishiguro's amalgam cultural background in which his concept of self and “otherness” are entwined in an “unhomely” world of English.

Kristeva (1987) in his book “*Tales of Love*” explicate, "without a precise body image, the anxious child has lost his individuality, as an alien in a world full of desire and power" (Kristeva, *Tales*, p. 382). “An alien” appears into open and considering her a ghost Madame runs into: “it's like walking past a mirror you’ve walked past every day of your life, and suddenly it shows you something else, something troubling and strange” (Ishiguro, p. 36). The restless child's self-awareness becomes cynical as the acquainted “mirror image” of her ego discloses to be something else, not only for oneself, but in the eye of an outside person. Hence, the statement that “I am the other” is established by others and it stimulates “a cold moment” (p. 36) at the point when Kathy observes herself through the perspective of Madame.

In another work "*The Strangers to Ourselves*" Kristeva (1994) suggests, "we are foreigners to ourselves, and it is with the help of that sole support that we can attempt to live with others" (p. 170). Ishiguro highlights the sexuality in order to articulate the element that our physical bodies, while responding to biological desires, act as they are foreign to us regardless of our hard efforts to repress our sexual urges. The sexual desire is regarded as an "animal factor", which can be regarded as an original yearning, as it every now and then cannot be abstained merely by the ethical awareness and morality we have. The basis and aim of such an instinct is far more somatic like an important element to construct an image of self. Kathy has encountered a few sexual practices since she reached following her own instinct. Nevertheless, sex cannot be graded as an activity to release one's desires at some instinctive stage: it is redirection from a sensual impulse and trite platitudes to serious human emotions. Sometimes disturbed by the shameful feeling of arbitrary sexual connections, Kathy wishes to locate someone and develop a relationship just as Ruth and Tommy's having added moral as well as emotional involvement. As communicated earlier "sex can affect emotions in unexpected ways" (Ishiguro, p. 83), the clones acknowledge the act of sex on their own to comprehend what is the basic instinct and it differs from the emotion. Determined to reconstruct their understanding of self, the clones in the novel are not inferior in comparison to human beings. For Ishiguro, skill of writing is like a consolation to hide away or rewrite the undesired and harsh realities, "you can somehow reorder it or try and come to terms with it by actually creating your own world and own version of it" (Vorda, Herzinger, Ishiguro p. 151). Kathy along with her friends is stimulated to contest and to regard their inventive works as a mean for their individuality. While opposed with "actual" humans with the display of their assimilated behavior, the clones feel keen to exhibit what may they also enjoy such as creativity, sexuality, emotion and imagination.

Dominating the center of the world, humans seldom care about what technology or instruments they take so long as they can make ends meet. Haran, Kitzinger, McNeil, O'Riordan (2008) states about an anticipation of a human-cloning future: "health is represented as the ultimate consumer good and it is implied that the rich are willing to

invest heavily in their efforts to achieve good health, longevity and children. It appears that no one cares to look too closely at the methods they employ to meet their goals” (*Human Cloning in Media: From Science Fiction to Science Practice*, p. 58).

Bhabha (2000) in his “*Cosmopolitanism*” tell the theme of homelessness, Hailsham is portrayed as the return of Ishiguro's repressed memory for “home”, the repetition in a particular situation and dominant culture. For Ishiguro, Hailsham is not only a projection to the United Kingdom of the 1990s, but by projecting forward into a future when the opposition between “us” and “them” it becomes a global issue. The novel functions as uncanny echoes of a cosmopolitan era which opens “ways of living at home abroad or abroad at home” (p.587). While faced with such intersubjectivity, no one is identical with himself/herself. Split internally as we are, at present and in the future we are all strangers to ourselves and we are all the others in particular ethical situations full of foreignness. No matter how the world changes and no matter how home becomes unhomey or vice versa, the motto of “being told and not told” remains unchanged.

Schmelzer states that, panoptic gaze objectified the subject, making it a text, an unwieldy collection of file folders united under the aegis of a name” (p.130). Her lens is strictly limited to how panopticism affect collegiate education in how it “enable[s] meticulous control over the network of power relations that produce and sustain the truth claims of an institution by means of economical surveillance.” (p.127)

In another argument is raised by Reg Whitaker’s “*The End of Privacy*” (1999), he draws on Foucaultian and panoptic principles expressly. He takes pains to explain that the Benthamite conception of panoptic power is woefully outdated and that the march of technologic and sociologic processes have moved past what Bentham saw as the ideal social control mechanism. Whitaker writes that “the panoptic technology spread from specialized, enclosed institutions to 5 administrative authorities that organized these institutions and finally to state apparatuses whose major, if not exclusive function is to assure that discipline reigns over society as a whole” (p.37), meaning the organized police forces.

Gordana illustrate Panopticon is a disciplinary tool that separates and subjugates its inmates and, in short, “imposes compulsory visibility upon those whom it subjects to discipline, while those in power remain invisible” (p. 86), causing the observed to modify their behavior to better fit the norm of the prison itself. Kattakayam (2006) in “*Power and Knowledge: Some Reflections on Contemporary Practices*”, focus on “the machinery of power articulates its effects of power with reference to a certain type of knowledge which is derived from the same machinery and which in turn extends to and reinforces the effects of power” (p. 461). There can be no power without a constituent field of knowledge to shore it up, and by the same token there is no knowledge that does not constitute a power relation. Moreover in even simpler terms, knowledge and power cannot exist in a vacuum independent of each other.

Toker and Chertoff (2008) in “Reader Response and the Recycling of Topoi in Kazuo Ishiguro's *Never Let Me Go*” states the observation that Hailsham is certainly displaying at least a few structures of an isolating environment. They have faith in, “a panopticon where the students are under constant surveillance” (p.169). This emphasis towards the tyrannical and distressing panopticism from Hailsham is either broadly equated to the major discussion points presented in this study where the concentration on panopticism is the prime concern.

Thomas Allmer (2012) in “Towards a Critical Theory of Surveillance in Informational Capitalism” maintains that by the term Panopticon, “Foucault exhibits understanding of disciplines as forms of operational power relations and technologies of domination” (p.18). Ones with the focus on contemporary surveillance used as a technique of outlining and social distribution also incline for emphasizing the intimidating or derivational element of the Panopticon.

All the reviews of different writer, journals, newspapers and critics about the novel and author, it enhances the magnificence of the work. The next section describes the theatrical framework of this research.

Research Methodology

This work is conducted to study disciplinary power in *Never Let Me Go* by Ishiguro. This study is qualitative textual analysis. Nature of this research project is descriptive as well as analytical. Data collection is done by using both primary and secondary sources. The concepts of Foucault about panoptical surveillance are used as key concepts in this research project to unveil the subjugation of human bodies under systems of authority and power. The theory of panoptical surveillance *Discipline and Punish* (1975) is used in this research. The information are in Phrases, discourse of characters, depiction, dialogues and quotes inside Kazuo Ishiguro's *Never Let Me Go* which display persuading to the panoptical surveillance due to the presence of institution and device of institutional power.

Theoretical Framework:

The theoretical framework of this study is based on Foucault's concept of panoptical surveillance. This study focuses on the analysis of the novel *Never Let Me Go* to explore the panoptical surveillance and its impact on the society. Panopticon (all seeing) is a type of building that was firstly designed by English philosopher and British social theorist Jeremy Bentham in 1785. Panopticon is a cylindrical wall of prison cells surrounding a central tower; this tower comprise a room circular by 360 degrees in one way, meter allowing the government to see everyone but prison cannot be seen from outside, they only saw themselves in this way, they are targeted. This omnipotent model is considered to have the power of intellect. Panopticon also used for hospitals, schools, asylums, prison cells and for institutions. For example cameras are used on highways, if a person exceeds from the given speed limit, that limit of speed was watched through the traffic controlled cameras. The idea of panopticon is advanced now-a-days and CCTV cameras are used. It allows the surveillance of any object. Surveillance is a close and continuous observation of any place and activity of any person and group to collect any beneficial evidence. This study aims to expose the destructive role of panoptical

surveillance as an institutional technological tool for subjugate individual as well as society.

A founder of modern utilitarianism, Bentham described *The Works* (1843), the Panopticon “as a new mode of obtaining power of mind over mind” (p.39). He built an inspection house and in which the institution will be able to watch inmates. Bentham’s mechanisms of surveillance are used as a instrument for subjugation and societal control. The inmates never known that they are watched and their behavior is to be controlled. This Panopticon also refers to “panoptes” in Greek mythology, which means giant with a hundred eyes. Foucault also seen panoptical surveillance as an anonymous power as he describes in the novel *Discipline and Punish*, “We have seen that anyone may come and exercise in the central tower the functions of surveillance, and that this being the case, he can gain a clear idea of the way the surveillance is practiced” (p.198). His surveillance is practice by imposing the strict rules and principles and stealing their freedom and personal emotions and happiness.

Michel Foucault, a French 20th century philosopher and historian who precede and discuss the concept of Jeremy Bentham's Panopticon. Foucault transforms this concept into what he termed as disciplinary society. Disciplinary society means terror of all time at the eye of law because people know that they might be watched and they might be punished. In this way, people fear to speak against unfair laws. He was against that surveillance as it interrupts the privacy of personalities and refers it as evil mechanism, but he is also in favour of panopticon because the continuous and constant surveillance reduces criminal activities. In *Never Let Me Go* clones live in panopticon environment where they are unknowingly observed by the power of institution to rule clones mind. Foucault spends his life criticizing the power of modern capitalistic state. Foucault views of panoptical surveillance, disciplinary power, power dominance, and institutional power seen in the novel of Kazuo Ishiguro’s *Never Let Me Go*. Hailsham is a living school where students are trained and educated to be clone. Hailsham plays the role of authority and students like Kathy, Ruth and Tommy serves the role of puppet, who never speak for their rights. Kathy H is the main character of the novel and narrates the story. She recalls

the story of love and friendship during her student life. She resigns her job as a carer and going for her first donor.

Foucault describes his concept of panopticon through disciplinary power. He shows discipline in submissive bodies. Modern institution requires individual bodies for their task, by their observation and their control. Discipline creates new form of individuality in the bodies as the requirement of modern time. Foucault states that distinct bodies should be controlled through the control of different characters. First is cellular, it creates different types of distribution of bodies. Next is organic, in which make sure that activities that are required for the bodies are natural for them. Third character is genetic, controls the evolution. Last one in combinatory in which additional force is inserted in one body. As Ishiguro states in *Never Let Me Go* that Hailsham is set up to “demonstrate to the world that if students were reared in humane, cultivated environments, it was possible for them to grow to be as sensitive and intelligent as any ordinary human being” (p.261). This is shown through the narration of Kathy H that clones are treated like ordinary human beings and live in civilized environment but they are trained as useful human organs. Foucault describes the constant visibility creates invisible threat. This is the major state of panopticon, in which a person is persistently observed but the detected person cannot see observer. This creates invisible observance. Clones also live in same panoptic environment where they are continuously being observed and scrutinized but clones themselves are not aware of it. Their activities are under the control of power but clones are unable to perceive it.

So panopticon is a process of power and observation, a subconscious desire to conform to the society, “surveillance is designed into the flow of everyday life” (Lyon). He balances the sociological background of surveillance. He presents a point for the rise of surveillance technologies. Therefore, Panopticon plays an important role in society, without panopticon society becomes functionless.

Discussion and Analysis

This chapter deals with the analysis of the novel “*Never Let Me Go*” with respect to Foucault’s concept of panoptical surveillance. In order to analyze the panoptical surveillance in *Never Let Me Go*, it is important to understand what panoptical surveillance is, how it is applied and what are effects of panoptical surveillance on subjugated society.

Panopticon Hailsham society

Panopticon Hailsham society deals with indebtedness of Ishiguro’s characters with everything that belongs to disciplinary society. Influence of vigilance environment has made the students of Hailsham disciplinary as exposed through the study of panoptical surveillance.

“Disciplinary power” is a term used by Foucault *Discipline and Punish*. “Disciplinary” means constituting, enforcing and concerning discipline and he argues that modern society is a disciplinary society and “power” is largely exercised in a variety of institutions like schools, prison house, asylum and militaries. Disciplinary society is rule based society where everything is happened in definite guidelines. He considers disciplinary power, a usage of power that is endless, invisible and internalized. Surveillance is also the significant part of disciplinary society, in which power is do exercises on those who represent the self-governing authority in everyday dealings by their own dominant rules. This disciplinary based society effect the life of surrounding people.

Foucault’s concept of panopticon is enlarged through the function of disciplinary power and furthered discipline is apparatus of power. He shows his concept of power through his own concept of bio power and bio politics. In bio power and bio politics,

extension of power is achieved through the subjugation of bodies both politically and physically. The environment of Hailsham create mysterious environment where act of cultivation of human organ terms as technology of bio power, and where all the characters are clones of their producers. In which humans are created and trained with the idea of benefiting of other human being. So, the panoptic environment of the school makes “the meticulous control of the operations of the body, assured the constant subjugation of its forces and imposed upon them a reflection of docility-utility” (Foucault p.137). It depicts that clones as subjugated and trapped in their life. They have to donate their body parts and organs in anticipation of death and incapability to recover.

Panopticon power is depicted throughout the novel. It is shown through the subjugated clones that they have to exercise discipline, fruitful and productive. This discipline can be maintained through the strict rules and principles applied at Hailsham. These rules are described by their school teachers and these teachers are the representations of power in relation within the students, “The door was almost half open—it was a sort of rule we couldn’t close dorm doors completely except for when we were sleeping” (Ishiguro p.71). So it depicts that these clones are in extremes surveillance, where they even cannot shut the doors at night because the feeling of being watched all time is injected to them. Power is internalized, invisible and endless through panoptical surveillance.

Foucault’s works mostly deal with power. The power connects itself in adaptable the behavior of characters, the classifications of knowledge, a social institutions and each relations between individuals. Foucault in “*Discipline and Punish*” applies the idea of power and describes the development of modern prison. He displays the ways in which the prison system is the metaphor or miniature of physical and outgrowth of power structures in society. He succeeded in conveying the authority behind the façade. “The ‘Enlightenment’, which discovered the liberties, also invented the disciplines” (Foucault p.222). In which, he describes dual meaning of enlightenment, firstly it is the world of liberty and right and secondly it is the world of pressure, coercion and inequality. Therefore, here panopticon serve as a ruling disciplinary world, where the liberal light

was even more capable to bondage. Ishiguro has selected the Hailsham, in which the human clones are the target and their position more powerless bodies. These clones were considered “poor creatures”, “Sometimes I get so immersed in my own company, if I unexpectedly run into someone I know, it's a bit of a shock and takes me a while to adjust” (Ishiguro p.208). This is very hopeless, isolated and powerless condition of Kathy. She cannot do anything, even she know, that she was raised as special donor children. She slowly reveals how simply deception defines her life. She lives in penalizing place and she studies and grows in imprisoning institution. She has to live according to the rules given by institution

Panopticon approach is to create docile bodies that can be exposed, used, transmuted and upgraded. Hailsham exercises disciplinary power like many other schools. This approach has task to make the student's discipline, restrained, dynamic, productive, submissive and obedient. Panopticon is exercises in the form of discourse containing written and oral. This power makes the Hailsham to control the pupil's behavior. Panopticon surveillance through discipline power targets for discipline groups. Hailsham creates certain guidelines for discipline to regulate students. The most prominent example of implementing rule is recovery center. Medical workers at recovery center has more awareness in medical zone and they exercised control to the donors through instructions such as taking “lab tests” and “sign out” if the clones want to go out for a trip so they have to “ sign in” when they return to recovery center (Ishiguro p.275).

Panoptical surveillance to create discipline is exercised through duties as well. The responsibilities of Hailsham are; to follow the guidelines, attend the classes and doing the college's assignments. The main duty of human clones is to take caution of many other social clones, who are currently doing their donation program. They have to make the donor calm before donation. They also help the donor in their recovery, make it faster and also make the donated clones happy.

One example of “normalization” and “naturalization” of panoptical surveillance in Hailsham is the form of creativity. Creativity is an important activity for each and

every student through their discourse. Art of each student displays their soul and Hailsham as institution tries hard to evidence to the administration and the entire social order that human clones also have soul, “we took your art because we thought it reveal your souls. Or to put it more finely, we did it to prove you had souls at all” (p.260). Thus, a work of drawing and creativeness of pupils is the more significant part for the existence and survival of Hailsham. Hailsham improves the creativity among students such as “painting”, “drawing”, “poetry”, and “art appreciation” (p.27). Additionally, Hailsham has organized an event called “Art Exchange” that enables pupils to trade their art works with other pupil’s art work. Students learn about the significance of art through the evolving method, which also increase their interest in highly regarded and creatively produced works. Therefore, students who excel at ‘creating’ are more likely to be respected and liked by others (p.16). On other hand, if any pupil displays a lack of originality, other classmates will despise them, as Tommy is experiencing. Tommy draw a picture “of an elephant standing in some tall grass”, this made the whole class to laugh. In this way, Hailsham as a disciplinary institution affect the mindset of their students.

Hailsham also has examination process. As it is described in following section, examination is a disciplinary power mechanism that blends surveillance and normalization. In reality Hailsham’s focus on Art and creativity is release therapy for donors. An expression of release is provided to make their subjugation prolong in the name of discipline. It is also panoptical surveillance. Through art, they can know inners of donors and they can take precautionary measures. It is highlighted their clones felt the pressure of panoptical surveillance and discipline, how can human beings not feel that. Resistance again than has to be tamed with other disciplinary actions and surveillance.

Punishment, is a portion of disciplinary power at Hailsham. Punishment is functional on the students of Hailsham who are not submissive, who show non-docile behavior for instance disobedience, wickedness and reluctance to do institute’s conventions and “punishing the incorrigible, guarding the insane... training the rising race in the path of education: in a word, whether it be applied to the purposes of perpetual prisons in the room of death...” (Bentham p.86). The rule of punishment is set to make

the students more discipline, so they won't repeat their actions. In the novel, Kathy narrates the story and also shows her disparity towards the rule of punishment. Tommy mostly was punished due to his absence of creativity. Throughout the novel, the penalty was never told as bodily but regularly as a suppression and subjugation that makes Tommy senses disheartened and furies. This rule of punishment is like the Foucault idea of punishment. He assert that modern punishment no longer affect the person's physical condition, but punish the soul, and rather than bodily, but affect their feelings, feelings, willpower and inclination. Students at Hailsham are controlled from every side of life. Hailsham is considered as a disciplinary institution because it also shows resistance. It prevents every pupil to drive outside the school zone and bound these human clones at Hailsham.

Storytelling is also part of disciplinary Panopticon Hailsham society. In storytelling ideologies their minds are controlled and disciplined. They also make terrifying and creepy stories to make the student's atmosphere frightened to drive outside. Once, Kathy subtly displays her desire to walk outdoor that is contrary to Hailsham's proscription. Even though, Kathy not once directly expresses about her emission, but there are certain cases in the novel, which depicts that Kathy tries to disobey, challenge and violate her fate. Unfortunately, Hailsham is a remote place which enables her to test the physical restrictions which narrow her liberty, "The little footpath that went all round the house was a real favorite of mine... I suppose part of the reason I liked it so much was because I was never sure if it was out of bound" (p.44).

Institution is a big and central society, which clamps many phases of human lifecycle like supremacy, communication, information that concept disciplinary power relation. Foucault has well-known, "institutions are one of the ways in freezing particular relation of power so that a certain number of people get some benefit and others will be harmed" (O'Farrell). In "*Never Let Me Go*" the authorities set the life of clones spend in such a way that they left with many limitations. In Hailsham, the representatives of institutional authority are guardians. The guardians are a terms used for clone's school teacher. These guardians have lawful rights and duty to take care of pupils. These

guardians are much intelligent and in various ways, they control the pupil's thoughts to, create the restriction of their beliefs in defining good and bad, "When she did speak, Miss Lucy seemed to be weighing up each word carefully. It's not good that I smoked. It was not good for me so I stopped it. But what you must understand is that for you, all of you, it's much, much worse to smoke than it ever was for me" (Ishiguro p.68). Miss Lucy, who is one of Hailsham's guardians, tries to mold the mindset of children and this is a power relation that transfers the notion of smoking to pupils through their guardian's discourse.

This chapter has depicted the fact that, Ishiguro's characters are typical example of disciplinary society. Kathy, Ruth, Tommy and other students are true victim of disciplinary institution, Hailsham. Power is exercised on all of them and they have to live in rule based society and also highlight the panoptical surveillance in this novel. Next chapter will highlight how these human clones are under the subjugation and under surveillance and also focus on types of surveillance.

Technological subjugative surveillance

It describes how characters of the novel *Never Let Me Go* are subjugation of clone's life under different types of surveillance, discussed through the concept of bio politics and also highlight the panoptical surveillance and explore the power mechanism hidden behind this brutal system.

Discipline is eminent by Foucault as "an art of human body which was directed not only at the growth of its skills, nor at the intensification of its subjection, but at the formation of the relation that in the mechanism itself makes it more obedient as it becomes more useful and conversely" (p.138). Discipline is an art of producing submissive, docile, tamed and obedient and dutiful characters. These are used for the sake of economic and political requirement of the institution. Human bodies are the entity of measurement, scheming and calculation with individual disciplined bodies only to attain national interest. Therefore, modern man is considered as "an animal whose politics

places his existence in question” (p.143). Studying and staying in this isolated, generalized and extensive disciplinary society, where social and political order is achieved through control and modern man feels the technological subjugative surveillance in every aspect of his life.

He focuses on the concept of technological subjugative surveillance in the life of clones. Subjugation carries something or someone under the supremacy of control. The study of subjugation includes three levels, which are physical subjugation. Mental subjugation and political subjugation respectively. First deals with the concept of physical subjugation, which integrated with the Foucault’s concept of bio power and discipline. These two concepts and physical subjugation are carried out through the panoptical surveillance of different bodies within the surrounding world. Second deals with mental subjugation, it concludes that the subjugation is shown in clones through education. They learn that their notion of life is inferior to that of humans and they have to adopt the human norms to obtain and get their life value. The final consideration is political subjugation that explores the legal and lawful existence of clones and probes into the political energetic forces behind the yield of organs. The subjugation is also defined with imperialism by the French writer Cheikh Hamidou Kane in his novel *Ambiguous Adventure* (1961). He portrays black people as shadow and white as light, “shadow is lightning as white” (p.58). Black has to live in the rules that were given by sovereign. In short, they also live in disciplinary society.

The production of the clone is used to cure the human, which was earlier irredeemable disease. The complete life of clones is under the control of power, surveillance, and observation and the rule bound mechanisms. Hailsham programs their clones, docile and useful as they serve the donation program. It also echoes the concept of Foucault in which he describes the four aspects of discipline, involving “control, classification and regulation of space, time,” human development and the composition of forces. (p.162). Foucault also describes the three others methods of disciplinary society, classified as “hierarchical observation”, “normalization judgment” and the “combination

of the two, is examination”. So, above four aspects and three aspects are rooted and entrenched in the physical subjugation in the clone’s lifespan.

The center of physical subjugation is a physical place. A remote area, the institution of clone, named Hailsham, “demonstrate to the world that if students (clones) were reared in humane, cultivated environments, it was possible for them to grow to be as sensitive and intelligent as any ordinary human being” (Ishiguro, p.261). The students of Hailsham live in cultivate environment, where they are physically subjugated and their guardians train them to live far from the real human beings, not to make friends and live in the boundary of Hailsham. It means, they try to make clones as a useful human organs. On the other hand, the school structure is insightful of Panopticon and also the administration of Hailsham tries hard to promise “the meticulous control of the operations of the body, assured the constant subjugation of its force and imposed upon them a reflection of docility-utility” (Foucault, p.137). Hailsham is a poison like place, which produce the new art of human body in a relationship of mutually constituting productivity. These clones are ignorant, watched and recurrently display their fears of being closely observed all the time. These clones lived in deserted, isolated; barren, abandoned countryside where common, ordinary and conventional people cannot easily entered accessed, contacted and noticed. Clones are extremely physically subjugated in Hailsham, there are even many days passed to see any type of van, vehicle, car and wagons. The association and acquaintance between Hailsham and the exterior world are only these vans or Lorries that bring many supplies, gardens, workmen, and “Madame” who comes up usually twice or occasionally three or four time for the students to select their best artistic art work. In this way, clones are completely removed from the human world and here Hailsham represented like a reclusive cell that was separated from the people.

Guardians at Hailsham are like mentors, tutor, advisor, namely parents, teacher and supervisor. They play important part in the life of clones and physical surveillance. Clones spend their 16 years in this institute where they have been always examined, surveyed and observed. This Hailsham is extremely large school with “full of hiding

places, indoors and out”. Miss Emily can always call them and there is no place for these students to avoid the surveillance. For example, these guardians are always around the students during all the day, from the morning assembly till the night. During the extra-curricular activities, guardians are not reluctant to observe the students even in the playground. As Kathy told in her reminiscence, that her friend Tommy was an excellent player but he loses his temper on the other boy’s pranks. He always screams and bales on the ground. All the girls, who sit there watch that wishes for guardian to come from the house to take him away. It is concluded, that the structure of the school serves as a physical subjugation. Students are always under the observant and attentive eyes of guardians. This type of subjugation is shown in *Women at Point Zero*, through her character Firdous. Firdous is subjugated by her father, her uncle, her husband, her lover and through every man she trust, “She is free to do what she wants, and free not to do it” (Saadwai p.95).

From the complete life of clones, they live in disciplinary society, where bio power and subjugation is physically exercised in these clones. Their bodies are self-controlled, supervised, well organized and disciplined. Their minds are also being shaped and this mental subjugation is in fact the education, which is received in Hailsham. These clones are mentally educated, to grow in the world and serve the special purpose. These clones are gradually resigned to their fate. *Never Let Me Go* is compared with an Irish playwright Samuel Beckett’s *Waiting for Godot* (1953), Lucky, Estrogen and Vladimir all are the victims of their civilization and they accept their fate. They are mentally subjugated. They are continuously waiting without doing any work and according to them their fate is decided by Godot. Such as the fate of clones is definite by Guardians of Hailsham. In the novel, students have been told about, who they are, and how they are diverse from the guardians and from the exterior world, since very younger age. The other students at Hailsham and also Kathy feel sense of dependency, inferiority and subservice from the way they are treated. Beckett describes in *Waiting for Godot* that “Nothing happens. Nobody comes, nobody goes. It’s awful” (p.39). These lines depict anguish, forlornness and desire. It describes the same situation in Ishiguro in *Never Let*

Me Go. The clones live in that institution, where no one goes outside and randomly selected people from outside. This is the subjugation of clones at Hailsham.

At the age of eight, Kathy with her friends tries to find out, how Madame think of them and the deliberately see how she responds. Though Madame reacts quite slightly and these students still notice “the shoulder she seemed to be suppressing” and notice on her face “the real dread that one of us in the same way might be afraid of spiders” (Ishiguro, p.26). Ishiguro wisely used the word “spider” that means everything. At first spider is considered different from the animals like shark or a tiger the clones are reflected different from the normal human beings. The phrases like “a mirror” and “different to” depict that students are different largely based on the opinion of human beings. Secondly, spider is belonging to a kind of creature, that is inferior to human beings and clones are considered less than normal humans. They are also inferior because their life is miserable to live without any friends and also without any love. There is a moment, when they realize, that they are different “It’s like walking past a mirror you’ve walked past every day of your life and suddenly it shows you something else, something troubling and strange” (p.27). Thirdly people not just fear the spider but also think it horrible, disgusting and ghastly because it symbolizes damage, disruption, malice and mischief for its poisonous spleen and the slow death. Spider web is the institutional disciplinary and panoptical power of Hailsham and donors are victims. Sometimes clones are the source of fear with imprecise consciousness. The process of cloning is also like poison, a clone’s life is end after the four donations. Last but the most painful, that these spider can easily be destroyed by human beings with tools. Unfortunately, the organs of these clones are also effortlessly destroyed with tools for the sake of other humans. In short, metaphorically use of spider deceives a keen feeling.

Ishiguro’s mouthorgan Kathy, narrates the rules that is imposed on them to be “as much as anything the guardians had decided” (p.23). Miss Emily and Madame set up Hailsham to exhibit the world. It is possible for them to grow sensitive and intelligent clones as any ordinary human being (p.261). These clones live in an environment, where they are treated like the normal human beings but once Madame calls Kathy and Tommy

“you poor creatures” (p.272). The clones are mentally subjugated, the colonized subject of *The Wretched of the Earth* (p.1961). He describes the mentally colonial world as “the world of silence, the world statue, motionless” (p.51). Frantz Fanon describes the Manichaeism in decolonized world. Colonized is considered evil so, they show violence in resistance force against settlers. In short black are colonized and mentally subjugated to live in their place. As clones are mentally subjugated while living in Hailsham.

Foucault highlights the relationship between power and knowledge through Islamic Arab world. As a public intellectual Edward Said in his “*Orientalism*” that orient and occident are opposition terms, “Orientalism does not merely represent, a significant dimension of modern political and intellectual culture. So, that “Orient” was constructed as a negative inversion or downfall of western culture” (p.53). As clones are used negatively by the use of power and intellectuals of clones are trained through knowledge, given by higher authorities. These clones lived in technological subjugative surveillance. At the end of the first volume “*The History of Sexuality*”, Foucault summarizes the process by which the beginning of modern era, the mechanisms of state power and politics turn into bio power and physically, mentally or politically subjugation. In these politics of life, the lives of population were nothing what state cares for its own sake to relocate them. During the world war two, Jews were vastly confined by Nazi in the name of maintaining and promoting the life quality of German citizen like Edward Said, describes in his essay “*An Ideology of Difference*” that “Israel was a Jewish state established by force on territory...” (p.38). Foucault describes that their bodies are used to conduct scientific experiments, which serve the purpose of promoting for the safety and health of all qualified citizens. In fact, by firming the population, the state automatically exaggerated its sovereign powers.

Guardians at Hailsham knows that clones students are meet to destructive end and they never object it because it is for comfort and security of all the organic human beings. The authorities define clones without social community and deprive them of human rights. Clones have no idea or belief about right to live. Though, biologically clones are still humans, they are fashioned by scientist, who work for the state but it does

not mean that the sovereignty has the right to do their life, just as parents give birth to their children but they are not allowed to decide their death. This is an example of control, power and dominance. Science is now through symbol of cloning invades individuality and privacy.

When these clones of Hailsham stay at the cottage to learn the behavior of human beings then Ruth is the one, who is most excited to behave like human beings. She carefully perceives the other students, who have arrived at the cottage before her and studied their behavior wisely. Ruth picks up their gestures and even through away their collections. The resources she has taken massive care for many years simply because they don't keep collections. If questioned is asked that why Ruth does with her safety, shield and protection. She is making an effort "to move on, to grow up, and leave Hailsham behind" (Ishiguro, p.130). Ruth never left Hailsham behind. The fact is, Ruth copied the manner of living from other people, and it is the indication of her desire to seek norms. Ironically, Kathy finds out, "so many of the veterans' mannerisms were just copied from television" (p.120). It reveals the veteran desire to fit in the human world.

These clones struggle between the fear to die at any time and hope to qualify the life. They are aware and also ashamed of their own existence as a bare life. These clones do their best to qualify themselves equal to natural life. These efforts are also exhibited in their tragic fate and corrupted future. As docile and bare life, their fate seems to have been decided long time ago, treated as the "Other", they find it virtually impossible to escape the network of power designed and manipulated by human beings.

This chapter has depicted the fact that, Ishiguro's characters are typically example of physical and mental subjugation. Kathy, Ruth, Tommy, Guardians and others students at Hailsham are truly subjugated. They are prey of everything which suppress their life physically and mentally. It is exposed through subjugated characteristics and elements in this novel. Subjugation is shown through their dresses, behaviors, thoughts, styles, choice of music and their eagerness to go outside and adopt the behavior of normal human beings. The point to emphasize is, that clones live in an area, where they are physically

subjugated, they get education that is also mentally subjugated for them, these clones have no way to get rid of it because of institutionalization of power and dominance.

Conclusion

This study shows that Ishiguro presents the panoptical surveillance in *Never Let Me Go*. This study highlight mentally and physically subjugated clones in panopticon Hailsham society. Ishiguro, in *Never Let Me Go*, has unfolded the intense effect of disciplinary society and technological subjugative surveillance of clones through panoptical surveillance with the help of Michal Foucault theories of power and knowledge, bio power, bio political in *History of Sexuality*, and *Discipline and Punish*.

Panoptical surveillance is a term that is used to modify the behavior in any room, in which the person in the room or in institution don't know that he or she is observed but the outer person, head of institution or any powerful authority closely observe them, to tame them. The observed people are students at Hailsham and the observer party is the institution, Hailsham. These students live in rule bound society; this society is called "Hailsham panopticon society". According to Foucault, in discipline based society, power is exercised on them and it is mostly exercised on modern people. In this society, everything happens under the rules that were controlled by high authority. Kazuo Ishiguro has presented the life of numerous forms all across the world, mainly those people, who suffer mentally, physically and politically. *Never Let Me Go*, as a typical example, which represents the picture of the life and forms of clones that skillfully explore their remote state Hailsham, under the subjugation of the power. On the basis of analysis that has been explained on prior chapters conclusion can be made in accordance with the thesis's started problem statement. There are three deductions; first conclusion concerns with the panoptical surveillance exercised on clones or artificial humans, who live in Hailsham, a boarding school. The second result concerns with the form of power relation between organizations and characters and also the approach of institution use power on characters also third is the subjugation on clones. Two kinds of power are found. First is the power relation with institution and second is power relation with individual. The first is the power relations with Hailsham, organization that teach the human clones since their babyhood to the puberty. The second is the power relation between recovery center and characters. Foucault has illustrated that organizations are one of methods in icing specific relations of power so that people get some advantage.

This institute in the novel too applied panoptical surveillance idea which was initially a prison plan. The organization manages and supervises human clones in Hailsham and Recovery center. The sign of space distributing is in-between the human clones into certain spaces based on variety of characteristics. For instance, in Hailsham the place itself is secluded and pupils divide into altered space according to their gender and age. Every donor will have a room at the recovery center, but they still have complete

control and oversight. The organization in the book operates under strict supervision from guardians, supervisors and authoritative figures and medical centers. Characters also displayed resistance; Tommy's anger and behavior serve as a visual representation of this resistance. Kathy's thoughts, narrations and wishes serve as a representation of the invisible opposition. Ishiguro has tried to expose the modern world or disciplinary society through the concept of panoptical surveillance, and through the destructive future of clones or artificial human beings. Result of this thesis is that, human cloning the society but benefit for population control and to cure other humans. These clones are constantly live in surveillance in which they are physically, mentally and politically subjugated. Hence this thesis will provide something innovative the panoptical surveillance concept in the novel *Never Let Me Go*.

In today society, people live in panoptic world and that it is the part of their life. Through panopticon (all seeing), minds of clones are trapped and they are unable to find the reality and they live in technological subjugative surveillance, this study help the people to understand that their minds are controlled through power and dominance. Science is now through symbol of cloning invades individuality and privacy. This study focus to unveil the facts of technological subjugative surveillance in panoptican Hailsham society by emphasizing its role in the novel *Never Let Me Go*.

Works Cited

- Allmer, T. (2012). Towards a critical theory of surveillance in informational capitalism.
- Beckett, S. (1953). *Waiting for godot*. Grove Press.
- Bentham, J. (1843). The Works of Jeremy Bentham. *William Tait*.
- Bentham, J. (2020). *The panopticon writings*. Verso Books.
- Bhabha, H. (1992). The world and the home. *Social text*, (31/32), 141-153.
- Cannella, M. E. (2017). Unreliable Physical Places and Memories as Posthuman Narration in Ishiguro's Never Let Me Go. *Sanglap: Journal of Literary and Cultural Inquiry*, 3(2), 92-126.
- Currie, M. (2009). Controlling time: Never let me go. *Kazuo Ishiguro: Contemporary Critical Perspectives*, 91-103.
- El Saadawi, N. (1975). *Woman at Point Zero*, trans. *Sherif Hetata*. London: Zed.
- Fontana-Giusti, G. (2013). *Foucault for architects*. Routledge.
- Foucault, M. (1975). 1979 *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison*. New York: Vintage.
- Foucault, M. (1973). The birth of the clinic: An archaeology of medical perception. *Trans A. M. Sheridan Smith*, New York: Pantheon.
- Foucault, M. (2001). *An Archaeology of the Human Sciences*. Routledge.
- Foucault, M. (2022). *Confessions of the Flesh: The History of Sexuality, Volume 4*. Vintage.
- Guo, W. (2015). Human cloning as the other in Ishiguro's Never Let Me Go. *CLCWeb: Comparative Literature and Culture*, 17(5), 6.
- Ishiguro, K. (2005). *Never Let Me Go*. Faber and Faber.
- Ishiguro, K. (2005). *Review: Never Let Me Go*. The Village Voice.

- Kane, C. H. (2012). *Ambiguous adventure*. Melville House.
- Kattakayam, J. J. (2006). Power and knowledge: Some reflections on contemporary practices. *Sociological bulletin*, 55(3), 449-467.
- Kristeva, J. (1994). Strangers to Ourselves, trans. by Leon S. Roudiez (*London: Harvester Wheatsheaf, 1991*), 1.
- Kristeva, J. (1987). Stabat Mater." Tales of Love. *Trans. Leon S. Roudiez. New York: Columbia UP*, 234-63.
- Lee, C. J. (2020). Frantz Fanon. In *Oxford Research Encyclopedia of African History*.
- Lyon, D. (1994). *The electronic eye: The rise of surveillance society*. U of Minnesota Press.
- McDonald, K. (2007). DAYS OF PAST FUTURES: KAZUO ISHIGURO'S " NEVER LET ME GO" AS " SPECULATIVE MEMOIR". *Biography*, 74-83.
- Menand, L. (2005). Something About Kathy. *The New Yorker*, 28, 78-79.
- O'Farrell, C. (2008). Foucault on power and resistance. *Retrieved May, 9, 2016*.
- O'riordan, K. (2008). Human cloning in film: Horror, ambivalence, hope. *Science as Culture*, 17(2), 145-162.
- Pollock, S., Bhabha, H. K., Breckenridge, C. A., & Chakrabarty, D. (2000). Cosmopolitanisms. *Public culture*, 12(3), 577-589.
- Said, E. (1978). *Orientalism* pantheon books. *New York*.
- Said, E. W. (1985). An ideology of difference. *Critical Inquiry*, 12(1), 38-58.
- Taylor, D. (2014). *Michel Foucault: key concepts*. Routledge.
- Tink, J. (2016). The Pieties of the Death Sentence in Kazuo Ishiguro's Never Let Me Go. *Parallax*, 22(1), 22-36.

Toker, L., & Chertoff, D. (2008). Reader response and the recycling of topoi in Kazuo Ishiguro's *Never Let Me Go*. *Partial Answers: Journal of Literature and the History of Ideas*, 6(1), 163-180.

Vorda, A., Herzinger, K., & Ishiguro, K. (1991). An Interview with Kazuo Ishiguro. *Mississippi Review*, 20(1/2), 131-154.

Whitaker, R., & Whitaker, R. (2000). *The end of privacy: How total surveillance is becoming a reality*. New Press.