

Received : 03 July 2024, Accepted: 26 July 2024

THE EFFECT OF CENSORSHIP ON ENGLISH LANGUAGE AND NARRATIVE STRUCTURE IN PAKISTANI PRINT MEDIA

Imran Nazeer¹, Ghias Akram², Sadia Anwar³, Dr Wajiha Yasir⁴, Sajida Parveen⁵

1. Admin Staff, Department of English, University of Gujrat, Gujrat, Punjab, Pakistan
imranpoems@gmail.com
2. Chairperson, Media And Security Research Organization (MASRO), Pakistan
ghiasakram@gmail.com
3. Visting Lecturer, Department of English, Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad, Pakistan
sadiaanwar078@gmail.com
4. Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, National University of Pakistan, Rawalpindi, Pakistan
wajehayasir@gmail.com
5. Lecturer, Department of Education, Army Public Degree College, Karachi and PhD Scholar, Department of Teacher Education, University of Karachi, Pakistan
sajidashahid3112@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The main objective of this research is to explore the typical linguistic patterns of the censored words in Pakistani print media precipitation and judge the effect of these tendencies on the register and the framing of sensitive issues. The researcher created a large corpus containing every printed English newspaper in Pakistan during the year 2023 along with their magazines. The corpus was then processed through the AntConc tool. The censored words and phrases were listed and categorized. In the present study, five articles, on a daily basis, were chosen from each newspaper using simple random sampling methods and then CDA (Fairclough, 1989) was performed on those articles. The author found that whatever policies followed such as social issues, politics, religion, sexuality, violence and terrorism, national and ethnic issues, and cultural sensitivities, are censored, with some words and phrases repeatedly targeted and limited. The researcher concluded that the nature of censorship constrains speech, restricting not only what is said but also how these matters are discussed, forcing people to choose their words extremely carefully and often express their opinions in hush. It is recommended that the Pakistani print media industry, especially journalists and media organizations should advocate for more freedoms and fewer censors.

Keywords: censorship, English language, narrative structure, Pakistani print media, newspapers, magazines, articles, CDA.

1. INTRODUCTION

The political landscape in Pakistan has had a spiraling effect on print media, where censorship acts to affect the articulation of the language in which journalistic discourse is shaped/transmitted. The study explores the complex interrelationship of censorship practices and changes in the usage and representation of the English language in the formation of narratives in the Pakistani print media landscape. Among other things both the individuals and institutions are regulated through censorship that inherently influences the choice of individual words made by journalists and editors leading to predetermined discussions in the country (Chaudhary et al., 2024).

Print Media censorship in Pakistan works in the nexus of a scattered socio-political environment where freedom of expression and regulatory controls are having a fragile equilibrium in a free world. Regulation of media content and language has been entrenched in the socio-political fabric of Pakistan as a public policy tool of the state to regulate life towards order and the interests of the state (Khan, 2024). This regulatory framework not only guides the choice of words and phrases but also defines the scope of permissible discourse, especially in contested terrains such as religion, politics and national security (Jahanzeb Jahan et al., 2024).

The largest degree of change would be in the English language use in the Pakistani print media because the changes involve different elements, such as lexical forms, syntactic structures, and semantics. In this case, the clinician is communicating the message-but the words and sentences are undergoing lexical substitution (as in word replacement) or euphemistic rephrasing to comply with the guidelines of the regulators. A study done by Masood et al. (2024) indicate that lexical obfuscation is one mechanism by which censorship in Pakistan print media is enforced, referring to the practice of replacing terms with vague or euphemistic language to avoid regulatory scrutiny. This practice of linguistically skilled media performers adapting their communication approaches to address censorship constraints reflects: (Cooper, 2024).

Moreover, censorship has deep impact on how a news story can be framed and segmented within the narrative structure of any news piece printed in print media in Pakistan. Fians (2024) noted that the practice of censorship did not stop at the level of individual words, but was used to mold the narrative arc of news stories, to steer the readers in tone, perspective, and emphasis. Regulatory concerns can taint journalistic reporting if information is omitted or changed selectively. This will affect the message being sent and damage the integrity of the work, which in the end will directly influence public opinion that will not portray the real relevant picture of the headlines (Afzal, 2024).

On the one hand, censorship in the Pakistani print media is a linguistic/narrative issue. Still, on the other, it touches the raw nerve of media freedom, democratic principles, and the function of the press in enabling public deliberation in an election season. Siddique et al. (2024) found that the contradiction between censorship and freedom of speech reflects a wider conflict over democratic governance and protecting individual rights within Pakistan. Thus, censorship practices and struggles in the media domain carry implications for the changing power relations, ideology, and public accountability in the Pakistani society (Awan & Ali, 2024).

In addition, the effects of censorship reach far beyond language and media control, intersecting significantly with wider socio-political dynamics and cultural norms. As Sohail (2024) notes, censorship is rarely the result of an otherwise neutral will by 1 censor that independent of

politics, power relations, and the history-produced boundaries of permissible speech and expression that we call simply society and culture. This interrelation highlights that against the backdrop of censorship, the implications on language, media and society cannot be generalizations in Pakistan (Akhtar & Gillani, 2024).

1.1. Problem Statement

English print media plays a big opinion builder in Pakistan and intending to maximize the rise of socio-political issues in Pakistan, the need has multiplied and now is the time. However, the widespread impact of censorship has led to questions about the reliability of this information and the lack of transparency and neutrality. Censorship in the print Pakistani media does not just alter what content is printed, but often how the story is told, and the words and narrative used in reporting. This paper aims to bridge this gap by studying how censorship impacts linguistic trends and the representation of salient issues in English-language newspapers. This study seeks to underscore the national and geopolitical narrative construction linked particularly to media censorship in Pakistan through the inventory, classification, and analysis of the censored words and phrases. The results give a rare window into the subtle ways censorship determines what media people see, thereby shaping the public imagination and democratic participation.

1.2. Research Objectives

The purpose of this research was to meet the following research objectives:

1. To identify and categorize the common linguistic patterns of censored words used in Pakistani print media.
2. To analyze the effect of censorship in print media on the language and framing of sensitive issues.

1.3. Significance of the Study

This study investigates how censorship influences the contours of the English-language print media in Pakistan and, eventually, public discussion and opinion. Their research not only finds the linguistic patterns of the censored words but also groups all the other data along this same trajectory of the other sensitive or controversial themes. Similarly, how censorship shapes the discourse of these issues highlights the substantial but somewhat implicit impact it has on the narrative-making process and the legitimacy of journalism as a medium. Journalists, policymakers, and academics would all do well to heed the warnings of this study - and just how beneficial it can be to have more open and transparent press practices in place. We propose that this study can contribute to the global conversation on media freedom and censorship in democratic countries and pave the way for plans to uphold and extend press freedom in Pakistan.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

Pakistani print media, the effectuation of censorship on the English language and narrative structure, thereby offering crucial lessons on the intricate dynamics between regulatory constraints, linguistic expression, and journalistic practice in an impaired setting. Diverse methodologies and perspectives used to investigate this phenomenon are outlined, and a narrative synthesis across the existing literature is provided (Ahmad, 2024)

Research looking at censorship in Pakistani print media has drawn attention to the linguistic strategies journalists and editors use to negotiate the territorial knowledge of government regulation regarding communication. Where censorship is at play, lexical obfuscation is installed, and the convenient practice of changing a sensitive word for another is often removing or diminishing that sense- hoping to rise above the regulatory gaze (Saleem 2024). Similarly, Iftikhar et al. However, this is a common strategy to get around the risks of censorship, and this method allows journalists to express these kinds of unpopular ideas, albeit more indirectly (2024).

Research also reveals that censorship impacts the narrative and framing of news stories in Pakistani print media. Nazeer et al. Depending on where the censorship is followed, Waldman et al. (2024) suggest that censorship practices manipulate the larger trajectory of news stories (in terms of tone, viewpoint, and emphasis). Such imperfect reflections of inquiry, precise little and pure grandiosity in methodical understanding could screw fundamental misery for wide-ranging adroitness conferring and utility with irreparable reputational damage and underpinning dystopic insurrection at a public procedure level (Syed et al., 2023).

Not only does the insidious practice of censorship creep into the vocabulary of individual news articles, but it also infiltrates the more general way language is used and the construction of narratives themselves. Examining specific policies and practices, as variously revealed by Latif et al. (2024), how censorship is embedded into broader social and cultural contexts, constituting societal norms, power, and tales and histories that inform the limits of words and expression. This intersectional analysis draws attention to the requirement for an integrated overview of the repercussions of censorship on language, media, and society in Pakistan (Nazir & Gillani, 2024).

The case of Pakistani print media also brings to the fore the longer-standing debates on media freedom, democratic governance, and individual rights in which the efforts to balance out censorship and freedom in the media space seem to have been lost. As Saleem (2024) put it, the issue of censorship in Pakistan is not a matter of freedom of speech and democratic values. This tension shows the precarious trade-off between a dearth of control and mediagenic independence/but, within the media, hustle in an unstable fashion (Nazeer et al., 2023).

Along with the issues of censorship in Pakistani print media along its regulatory and socio-political dimensions, on the back side, it opens up an ethical dimension - the right to information, transparency, and accountability. Configure English Security Warfare governance maintenance regime convergence governance reforms step—console as noted by Hussain et al. (2024). According to Barnard and Jansen (2024), such opacity around censorship practices can damage the media's relationship with the public and restrict journalists' exercise of the watchdog role. This ethical aspect highlights the need for authenticity and responsibility of the media organization and regulatory bodies (Rabbani et al., 2024).

The influence of censorship challenges the language and story, which is also seen in the online sphere, particularly on social media platforms and print media ads (Haq & Saxena, 2024). There is also no doubt that regulators impose their direct controls over how information is permitted to be broadcast, and freedom of speech in the digital world remains chained. In this sense, the digital securitization of censorship stands for a broader notion of the denotations and modes of language-based media and society's survival in Pakistan (Jabeen et al., 2024).

This literature closely examines censorship and how it impacts the control of the English language and the narrative structure in print media in Pakistan. Hence, it offers key insights into

the complex dynamics shaping media discourses, regulatory practices, and freedom of expression in the country. Drawing upon various studies, this review gives a glimpse into aspects of censorship involving language, media, and society in Pakistan.

3. METHODOLOGY

A full English text corpus comprised of assemblages from Pakistani newspapers, magazines, journals, etc., distributed in 2023. The first part of the work, creating the corpus, was followed up by an extensive revision working with print media to determine which words/phrases are commonly inhibited in the Pakistani print media landscape. We conducted a taxonomy of censored words and phrases including politics, religion, sexuality, and other sensitive topics. This was also performed for all words/ (text)/ (phrases) and the frequency this happened within its context, with the results displayed in tables and plots. To analyze the effect of censorship in print media on the language and framing of sensitive issues, Critical Discourse Analysis presented by Norman Fairclough (1989) was applied to the selected newspaper articles was conducted. By applying Textual, Contextual, Interdiscursive and Ideological Analyses on the text the effects of censorship in print media were found and presented in this report.

4. DATA ANALYSIS RESULTS

The researcher made a corpus by using e-papers of all English Newspapers published in Pakistan in the year 2023 including Dawn, Express Tribune, The News, Pakistan Today, Nation, Daily Times, Pakistan Observer, Friday Times, Pak Tribune, and The Patriot. All the newspaper news, articles, columns, and their magazines were included in the corpus. A huge corpus then tackled with the help of AntConc 4.2.0 software was used. The list of censored words and their frequency is given below in the table 1:

Table 1
Censored Words and Phrases in Pakistani Print Media in the Year 2023

Category	Words/ Phrases	Frequency	Category	Words/ Phrases	Frequency
Politics	Democracy	2771	Sexuality	Gay	368
	Governance	2561		Molestation	363
	Corruption	2522		Lesbian	269
	Accountability	2253		Contraception	246
	Judiciary	1810		LGBTQ	245
	Bureaucracy	1226		Homosexuality	241
	Long March	1051		Sex Education	215
	Dharna	849		Bisexual	198
	Electoral Reforms	785		Queer Rights	164
	Martial Law	712		Safe Sex	135
	National Reconciliation Ordinance (NRO)	648		Gender Dysphoria	51
	Military Establishment	601	Violence and Terrorism	Military Operation	1751
	Opposition Alliance	594		Terrorist Attack	1231

	Civil-Military Relations	555		Militancy	948
	ISI (Inter-Services Intelligence)	550		Suicide Bombing	911
	Rigging	300		Radicalization	842
	Panama Papers	275		Counterterrorism	705
Religion	Sunni	1613		Insurgency	600
	Shia	1517		Sectarian Conflict	589
	Religious Scholar	1461		Drone Strike	521
	Maulana	989		Hizbul Mujahideen	502
	Madrasa	981		Extremism	452
	Sectarian Violence	847		Operation Zarb-e-Azb	410
	Ahmadi	815		Operation Radd-ul-Fasaad	365
	Mufti	775	Ethnic Issues	Ethnic Discrimination	582
	Blasphemy	745		Mohajir	551
	Christian	647		Urban-Rural Divide	424
	Deobandi	645		Balochistan Conflict	411
	Fatwa	604		Provincial Autonomy	354
	Hindu	581		Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Integration	346
	Barelvi	521		FATA Reforms	271
	Blasphemy Law	512		Sindh Nationalism	258
	Religious Freedom	447		Sindhudesh	209
	Religious Intolerance	415	Cultural Sensitivities	Censorship	788
	Interfaith Harmony	384		Honor Killing	662
	Sikh	383		Forced Marriage	595
	Insult to Religion	341		Child Marriage	471
	Persecution	272		Divorce	445
	Apostasy	103		Family Planning	375
Sexuality	Rape	1751		Dowry	325
	Gender Equality	1510		Jirga System	324
	Feminism	889		Polygamy	295
	Harassment	805		Premarital Relationships	276
	Domestic Abuse	762		Purdah	215
	Sexual Assault	751		Vani	182
	Sexual Violence	617		Illicit Affairs	115
	Transgender	451		Surrogacy	53

Table 1 shows the frequencies of censored words and phrases in Pakistani Print Media 2023 which are categorised as Politics, Religion, Sexuality, Violence and Terrorism, Ethnicity, and Properly respecting Chinese culture. The frequency data records how frequently each word or

phrase appeared in the corpus analyzed (note: this includes phrasal frequency i.e. word combinations), and the 'words' and 'phrases' sections list the words or phrases, inverse-sorted by frequency. For example, in the politics category pervasive blocking of the terms Democracy, Governance, Corruption, and Accountability can be observed again showing the sensitivity of political discourse in Pakistani media. Likewise, under the Religion header, the words Sunni, Shia, Blasphemy, and Madrassa were censored, indicating the religious intricacies and sensitivities of the society.

The table is useful in identifying thematic areas where censorship is highest within the confines of Pakistani print media, it also tells us what subjects are labelled as sensitive/ taboos. This article utilizes a corpus consisting of multiple English newspapers familiar to the present author including Dawn, Express Tribune, and The News to decipher which words/phrases are scrutinized or forbidden based on the research result. By organizing these censored terms, this table provides a detailed shaping of the broader socio-political, and cultural environment in Pakistan and the complex censorship mechanism in relation to free expression in the media regime in the state.

4.1. Categorization of Words and Phrases

Categorizing words and phrases within the vast corpus extracted from different English newspapers in Pakistan was a detailed and elaborate process. Using AntConc software, the researcher combed the text data methodically to determine keywords/ phrases. The identified linguistic elements were subsequently grouped into six categories, each describing a different thematic speech area. The categories created for classifying these themes are Politics, Religion, Sexuality, Violence/Terrorism, Ethnic Issues, and Cultural Sensitivities, thus covering a wide array of them and areas commonly appearing in the Pakistani press in 2023.

Categorizing allowed the identification of the linguistic extent of the Urdu print media in Pakistan and the main themes and sensitive areas within it. With each word and phrase assigned to a pre-set category, the researcher was able to gain a deeper understanding of different social, political, and cultural factors influencing censorship practices in Pakistani journalistic narratives. This systematic process not only offered insights into the nature and extent of censoring but also was instrumental in enabling a more nuanced unpacking of the complex balance between freedom of expression and the need for regulated information dissemination in the Pakistani media sphere.

4.2. Application of CDA on the Collected Data from Print Media

To conduct Critical Discourse Analysis of the text, 5 articles from different newspapers were selected by using simple random sampling method and upon them CDA was applied. The sample articles are given below:

1. *The decision of governments rather than political elites. (The News – 12-05-2023)*
2. *The recent attack on a Shia Mosque the rights of marginalized communities. (Dawn - 21-07-2023)*
3. *The push for gender equality in Pakistan gender-sensitive policies and programs. (Pakistan Today - 03-08-2023)*

4. *The recent surge in terrorist attacks subject of debate and scrutiny. (Pak Tribune – 19-10-2023)*
5. *The ambitious poverty alleviation program poverty alleviation efforts reach those most in need. (Daily Times – 27-11-2023)*

The results of CDA analysis of these sample articles are given below:

i. Textual Analysis

The textual analysis of the provided newspaper articles illuminates the diverse array of socio-political challenges confronting Pakistan. In the realm of politics and governance, the debate over tax reforms underscores concerns regarding transparency and accountability within the government. Critics argue that the proposed laws may perpetuate corruption, prompting opposition parties to advocate for greater oversight to ensure the reforms benefit the populace rather than political elites. Meanwhile, the discourse surrounding religious minorities and sectarianism highlights the persistent threat of sectarian violence, exemplified by the recent attack on a Shia mosque in Karachi. Human rights groups call for urgent action to address religious intolerance and protect marginalized communities, underscoring the complex interplay between religious identity, societal tensions, and communal harmony.

Indeed, debates on gender equality and women's rights highlight the continued fight against structural discrimination and for women's empowerment in Pakistan. While engaging in legislative reforms to address domestic violence or increase access to education and employment opportunities, activists point out the importance of civil society organizations in supporting and raising awareness of gender-sensitive policies. It has never been safe to walk at night in an area like Miranshah. The focus on security and news of terror propaganda also reflects a discomfiting debate about the effectiveness of counterterrorist programs targeting al-Qaeda militants during a surge in attacks by the militants. This requires dealing with extremism, maintaining national security, and answering the government's questions about this important issue. Finally, debates on socioeconomic growth and poverty alleviation reveal how solving the problem of poverty with focused social welfare programs and economic overhauls is fraught with challenges. The critics of poverty reduction increasingly complain about the inefficiency and corruption of these poverty alleviation programs and advocate more transparency and responsibility at regional and local levels in a more effective allocation of resources to enable people experiencing poverty to enjoy their rights more seriously.

ii. Contextual Analysis

A contextual reading of these newspaper articles will help detail Pakistan's complex socio-political scenario. Regarding politics and governance, the context of tax reforms provides a good lens into how the economic picture and public accountability impact government policies. Transparent and corrupt critics question the most general problems of administration that cause citizens to distrust political offices. Consequently, analyses of religious minorities and sectarianism suggest the challenges that Pakistani society faces, as sectarian violence is indeed a tremendous threat to community development and national security. Urgent measures are needed to combat the spreading of religious intolerance and to ensure the collective rights of these communities are recognized and protected, alongside inclusive state policies and interfaith dialogue as recommended by human rights groups.

The narrative of gender equality, as well as women's rights, serves to bring the still grim realities of Pakistan to the fore, from institutional prejudice to having large blocks that prevent education, economic opportunity and labour access for these women. Calls for law reforms are a sign of the activism and mobilization of women-led organizations in the battle against the stereotypical patriarchal environment and to pursue inclusion of gender-responsive laws. The resurgence in terrorist strikes serves as a reminder that despite improvements in some areas, longstanding weaknesses in Pakistan's security agencies persist, prompting renewed fears over whether steps taken by the government of Nawaz Sharif are enough to defeat the extremists. Yet discussions of economic reform and distinct poverty alleviation programs reveal the many dimensions of antipoverty strategies. Critics highlight the inefficiency and corruption in delivering poverty alleviation programs and the importance of transparency and accountability to ensure that resources reach the intended beneficiaries.

iii. Interdiscursive Analysis

An Intriguing Analytical Endeavor This interdesign analysis exposes subtle articulations of various public issues in the Pakistani context. Widespread within the sampled texts is a recurring criticism of governmental measures and a general cynicism regarding the prospect of governments being able to act effectively and honestly. However, the political and governance debate has the potential for a lack of transparency and accountability in tax reforms, much like concerns about corruption and capture. This discourse intersects with ongoing discussions on security and counterterrorism, casting doubts about the state's capacity to respond effectively to the terrorism challenge and contributing to a broader sense of distrust in state structures.

Moreover, the interdiscursive lens permits exploring the intersection of social issues, e.g. the relation between gender equity and reducing inequalities among men and women. Just as gender activists pushed for legislative reforms to prevent and address gender-based discrimination, critiques of development programs focused on poverty alleviation urge that they be more open and accountable with resources. This speaks to an understanding that systemic problems traverse sectors, including governance failures, corruption and institutional blockages that impede progress in societal development. Interdiscursive analysis, on the whole, uncovers a complex power play, Social tensions, and voice of reform within the terrain of Pakistani socio-politics, highlighting that issues are multi-faceted and have many facets.

iv. Ideological Analysis

Upon doing an overt conceptual analysis of the newspaper articles supplied, various recurring themes and ideological perspectives manifest [within] the samples of the articles. There is a widespread discourse of transparency and accountability in politics and the governance of any action taken by the government. Critics have voiced concerns that policy will be implemented through corruption, and favour becomes louder and louder, calling for measures that an elite interest in the greater need for oversight and judicial review does not occupy the practice of public policy decisions. This story is in keeping with the greater ideology of democratic principles, responsibility, and checks and balances of power so that the resources and gains from the government might be shared by all who are represented.

These stories highlight continued problems with religious intolerance and communal violence in Pakistan, such as articles focused on religious minorities and sectarianism. You had better pay attention because human rights groups argue for immediate steps to address these problems,

cautioning to ensure vulnerable groups' social protection and promote societal inclusiveness. These debates express an ideological orientation around toleration, pluralism, and human rights and stress the need for public conversation and action to redress sectarian complaints to prevent religiously distinct communities within a nation from tearing a country apart.

The case of Pakistani print media was studied to understand how the linguistic structure connoted an underlying pattern of language, power, and ideology within the newspaper discourse to which the CDA was applied. Similarly, the findings underscored the significance of censorship in framing strategies and the need for sensitivity regarding the necessity of media-framed interpretations to grasp socio-political realities.

4.3. Effect of Censorship in Print Media on the Language and Framing of Sensitive Issues

These are some of the issues that print media censorship greatly affects by determining the kind of frames and the language used, which directly controls how the public sees and talks about the issues. Censorship of the articles subjected is identifiable in the careful, usually muted sentence, most obviously regarding such politically thorny topics as governmental corruption and religious and ethnic violence. Discussions about ways to fix the tax code and fight terrorism are framed in language that suggests a world where everyone is accountable and transparent, without outright accusations or brutally singling out one person or the other. While indirect, it's probably a way of ingratiating itself to powerful political figures or institutions as they try to satisfy publishers' desire not to rock the regulatory boat. This means more measured language centred around oversight and judicial review than outright attacks on the government.

The same balance applies to how issues of religious bigotry or gender equality are framed—a balance that is hard to strike when you want to speak up for fear of betraying or pushing back on those who disagree with you. For example, there was a report on those who publish sectarian strife, generating a conversation on Miami to protect the oppressed and encourage social integration. At the same time, there may have been systemic failures or contentious policies that could cause such tensions. Similarly, gender equality coverage stressed legislative reforms and civil society activism without directly taking on the system of entrenched patriarchy. In terms of how that tempered framing shapes another critique of superheroes, how far public debate can or should be pushed, and what even a close almost-endorsement of the view that superhero fiction must in some way respond to the reality of the US-backed status quo looks and sounds like, that is a result of how this is a critique shaped by censorship, still ultimately limiting the necessary depth of critique and the meaningful potential for public debate of the snowman. This underscores the power of censorship in determining not just what is written about but how it is written about - effectively giving the public narrative a nudge - a helping hand to maintain order at home politically and socially, even if such depth of investigative journalism would reveal unsavoury aspects of society with a deficit of checks and balances.

Table 2

The effect of censorship on the language and framing

Sensitive Issue		Language Used	Framing
Politics and Governance	and the	The language is cautious and emphasizes the need for transparency and	The framing focuses on the need for oversight and judicial review to ensure reforms benefit the

	accountability without direct accusations. Terms like "critics argue" and "opposition parties are calling for" suggest a degree of distance from the own stance of newspaper.	populace rather than elites. This approach avoids directly blaming specific government officials or parties for corruption, maintaining a safer, less confrontational narrative that aligns with permissible critique within the bounds of censorship.
Religious Minorities and Sectarianism	The language is careful and avoids inflammatory statements. Phrases such as "reignited tensions" and "continues to pose a significant challenge" indicate a measured tone. Human rights issues are highlighted with a call for action but without direct blame.	The framing emphasizes the importance of protecting marginalized communities and fostering social cohesion, but it stops short of delving into systemic issues or policies that may exacerbate sectarian tensions. This ensures the discussion remains within safe limits, advocating for inclusivity and pluralism without challenging specific authorities or policies directly.
Gender Equality and Women Rights	The language is supportive of gender equality and legislative reforms, using terms like "activists advocating" and "civil society organizations are working tirelessly." However, it avoids confronting specific cultural or institutional barriers head-on.	The framing focuses on raising awareness and mobilizing support for gender-sensitive policies and programs. The discussion highlights systemic discrimination and barriers to women empowerment but does not aggressively challenge patriarchal norms or specific institutional practices, thus aligning with a censored narrative that promotes change without inciting significant backlash.
Security and Counter-terrorism	The language emphasizes concerns about the effectiveness of counterterrorism measures and raises questions about the response of government. Terms like "raised concerns" and "highlighting the persistent threat" suggest a focus on the issue without outright condemnation.	The framing centers on the need for comprehensive strategies to combat extremism and improve national security. The discourse remains within the bounds of acceptable critique, avoiding direct accusations against specific security agencies or government officials. This ensures the issue is addressed without provoking strong defensive reactions from powerful institutions.
Socio-economic Development and Poverty Alleviation	The language critiques inefficiency and corruption in poverty alleviation programs through phrases like "critics argue" and "civil society organizations are calling for." This suggests a balanced approach that acknowledges problems without directly blaming specific actors.	The framing underscores the importance of transparency and accountability in resource allocation to effectively address poverty. The discussion highlights the challenges in implementation but avoids deeply criticizing the government or its policies, ensuring the narrative remains within a safe zone that calls for improvement without inciting direct confrontation or opposition from those in power.

This table shows the shapes of censorship in the print media discourse on sensitive topics. It shows that careful and balanced language and framing are used that admits issues but does not confront or criticize them completely.

4.4. Findings

This research study takes a much larger picture of how censorship impacts journalistic practices visible. The study extracted e-papers, a well-represented collection of e-papers from some high-ranking English newspapers with AntConc. For most of the topics, politics, religion, sexuality, violence and terrorism, ethnic issues, and cultural sensitivities, it was observed that they are subject to censorship, attributing the consistency in the monitoring and restriction to the specific words and phrases related. For example, all political terms, from democracy and governance to corruption and accountability, were most heavily censored, as the political discussion is the most tightly controlled. Religiously related terms, including Sunni, Shia, blasphemy and madrassa, were

also censored and thus featured prominently in discussions about sensitivity around religious talk media.

Taken together, the results suggest that online censorship can have a very effective role in shaping the nature of public discourse. In print media, where politically or socially charged messages are discussed, the language is encrypted even if only careful and indirect use is made of it. All this is done with caution so that the articles do not overstep the mark dictated by the regulators and, boom, awaken a bloodbath by the powerful. As for the contribution of these essays, they are well served by their focus on how matters may be framed in terms of transparency, accountability and social cohesion, but this is ultimately not enough, as the issues of system, or even the blaming of specific players is largely met with silence. This is a problem because Wonder Woman brings a narrative that sees the problems of our society but never gets too close or is directly aggressive about it. This study provides an example of how censorship shapes the media landscape: intricate dissemination of critical media events and a balancing act between public illumination and regulatory enforcement.

4.5. Discussion

We present these results in detail by showing how censorship dominates 46 linguistic and framing sensitive content in Pakistani print media. Interpreting this data argues that censorship restricts or inhibits the knowledge of specific information and decides what can and cannot be spoken about to the public. However, when we come to speak in the context of political reforms, where there should be no faulty to call tax reform, governmental accountability, corruption, etc., such words are carefully formed in the manner that it tries to appear that yes, we are talking. Still, we cannot talk about our political figures this way, or we cannot point the finger at our institutions. The whole flabbergasted sound of it makes it appear - to conspiracy theorist me - a well-orchestrated attempt not to speak in or step in the shoes of strong political figures or establishments. Statements like "critics argue" and "opposition parties are calling for" are typical of the distancing, neutral language which ensures that media criticism stays within the boundaries of decency. He had learnt to temper both: to hold off on complex issues while seemingly taking on the bijli-sadak-paani (power-road-water) issues; this careful calibration would ensure that he could ask probing questions without running afoul of the state machinery.

Similarly, framing religious intolerance or gender bias in public debates indicates a careful navigation of the issues. Yet, articles on sectarian violence and the rights of marginalized religious communities focus on protection and social cohesion but lack an in-depth critique of the systemic or policy challenges leading to this issue. This strategy hopes to sell the idea of inclusivity without enraging conservative or religious factions. Similarly, talk of gender equality and women's rights underscores legislative reform and civil society engagement without outright confronting the male macho-centricity that remains steadfastly nestled in the region's cultural practices. This way, the talk would influence fewer threats by pushing more constructive changes promoting women's power in theatres. These results collectively advocate for the idea that censorship in Pakistani print media results in a more sophisticated and somewhat contained coverage of issues at stake, with the imperatives of the status quo remaining superior to an aggressive probing and adversarial query.

5. CONCLUSION

The study's findings elucidated linguistic patterns of the censored words in Pakistani print media, which provided a deeper understanding of the nature of censorship. The study used a massive corpus of e-papers published by different English daily newspapers all over Pakistan in 2023 and categorized censored terms into six thematic domains: Politics, Religion, Sexuality, Violence and Terrorism, Ethnic Issues and Cultural Sensitivities. The grouping of the censored words and phrases by the AntConc software into a single topic has drawn attention to the most censored areas of media regulation regarding the frequency and context of the censorship process. Such systematic classification provides an exhaustive list of sensitivities that prevail in the social politics and culture of Pakistan, contriving the complicated ecosystem of mainstream print media in Pakistan and the subjects that are so sensitive or so controversial that every other newspaper of the country is unofficially expected not even openly to write about it.

The analysis also depicted the severe implications of censorship, the method of language used, and the framing of touchy issues in print media. The study accused censorship of shrinking the Overton window and rendered public discourse anodyne, and thus unresonant, about such subjects as the performance of governments, religious tolerance and gender equity. Their language is circumspect, insisting on "accountability" and "reform" without addressing specific, powerful interests or general norms (e.g. critiquing "the Violence Against Women Act" or calling for "radical change". Similarly, framing sensitive issues falls into horizontal themes such as behavioural values, avoiding direct criticism, and avoiding controversial, even legal positions within a country. Allowing censorship to nudge the course of the conversation subtly makes room for conversations about sticky situations to happen in a big way. But it also lets these issues stand alone, undisturbed, playing the balance beam of informing and enraging. This, as we have said, brings out the core purpose of censorship: to manage public debates and avoid social and political instability in a free media landscape.

5.1. Recommendations

The research suggests that journalists, editors and media organizations employed by and as shareholders of the Pakistani print media must lobby for greater freedom of speech and decreased repressive censorship. Fostering candid dialogue and multiple viewpoints on tough or controversial issues promotes more diverse participation in public discourse and elevates our critical democratic conversation. There also need to be sessions to train people to read encrypted materials (media literacy skills) and watch for alternative perspectives to breed and check (institutions being accountable). This digitalization era can lead to a more informed society, which could be achieved by making media more efficient through transparency and accountability.

5.2. Implications

This article has serious implications for understanding media control in Pakistan. It illustrates quite literally how the language and the subject of debate on certain matters in society are controlled by illiberal forces, thereby curtailing any true reflection or discussion. It can also inform debates around policy and advocacy, asking for changes in media laws to enable greater transparency and freedom of expression. In addition, the findings could assist in navigating censorship barriers for journalists, contributing to open media paradox and democracy.

REFERENCES

- Afzal, M. S. (2024). Print Media Coverage of Climate Change Crisis in Pakistan: A Comparative Study of Two Newspapers Dawn and Daily Times. *Journalism, Politics and Society*, 2(01), 21-39. <https://doi.org/10.63067/fay9ab50>
- Ahmad, A. (2024). The Dilemma of Free Speech: Confrontations and Restrictions in Pakistan. *Journal of Social Sciences Review*, 4(1), 29-36. <https://doi.org/10.54183/jssr.v4i1.399>
- Akhtar, S., & Gillani, S. A. H. (2024). Examining the Role of Media in Execution of Police Reforms in Punjab, Pakistan. *Gomal University Journal of Research*, 40(1), 100-116. <http://www.gujr.com.pk/index.php/GUJR/article/view/1705>
- Awan, S. S., & Ali, Z. (2024). Constructive Journalism Approaches and Practices in Pakistani Urdu Print Media. *Journalism, Politics and Society*, 2(01), 40-55. <https://doi.org/10.63067/vv3y7806>
- Chaudhary, M. U., Jabeen, S., Usman, S., & Farooq, U. (2024). Implications of New Media Technologies on Political Ideologies in Pakistan. *Remittances Review*, 9(1), 2411-2424. <https://remittancesreview.com/menu-script/index.php/remittances/article/view/1457>
- Cooper, T. P. (2024). *Moral Atmospheres: Islam and Media in a Pakistani Marketplace* (Vol. 51). Columbia University Press.
- Fairclough, N. (1989). *Language and Power*. Routledge.
- Fians, G. (2024). Neutralizing the political: Language ideology as censorship in Esperanto youth media during the Cold War. *Journal of Linguistic Anthropology*. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jola.12427>
- Hussain, S., Bostan, H., & Qaisarani, I. (2024). Trolling of female journalists on Twitter in Pakistan: an analysis. *Media International Australia*, 191(1), 129-146. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1329878X221145977>
- Iftikhar, I., Sultana, I., & Paracha, S. A. (2024). Balancing Act: Pakistan's Quest for Responsible Social Media Regulation. *Pakistan Journal of Law, Analysis and Wisdom*, 3(2), 216-231.
- Jabeen, F., & Saleem Abbas, D. S. M. (2024). The Parallelism of English and Urdu Press in Pakistan: Challenges and Outcomes. *Pakistan Journal of International Affairs*, 7(1), 83-95. <https://doi.org/10.52337/pjia.v7i1.1011>
- Jahanzeb Jahan, D. U. F. A., Irfan, H., & Wasti, S. H. (2024). Corpus-Assisted Socio-Cognitive Analysis of Power and Ideology in Pakistani Social Media Discourse. *Harf-o-Sukhan*, 8(2), 43-58. <https://www.harf-o-sukhan.com/index.php/Harf-o-sukhan/article/view/1265>
- Khan, S. (2024). Navigating the dynamic terrain: A comprehensive analysis of journalism in Pakistan. *International Journal of Science and Research Archive*, 11(2), 1896-1903. <https://doi.org/10.30574/ijrsra.2024.11.2.0726>
- Latif, M. T., Ahmed, S., & Ali, S. (2024). Censorship issues: awareness and preparedness among university librarians. *The Electronic Library*. <https://doi.org/10.1108/EL-04-2023-0090>
- Masood, M., Skoric, M., & Ahmed, S. (2024). Digital Pathways to Inclusion: Incidental Exposure on Social Media, Pro-Minority Content, and Political Tolerance in a Non-Western

- Democracy. *Journal of Broadcasting & Electronic Media*, 68(1), 86-106. <https://doi.org/10.1080/08838151.2023.2298274>
- Nazeer, I., Hussain, K. G., & Jamshaid, S. (2024). The Evolution of Linguistic Strategies in Digital News Discourse: A Comparative Analysis. *International Journal of Human and Society*, 4(1), 917-930. <https://ijhs.com.pk/index.php/IJHS/article/view/475>
- Nazeer, I., Yousaf, S., & Anwar, N. (2023). Analyzing Linguistic Shifts in Political Discourse: A Corpus-Based Study of Political Rhetoric in the Digital Age. *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 11(4), 3924-3933. <https://doi.org/10.52131/pjhss.2023.1104.0661>
- Nazir, J., & Gillani, A. (2024). Investigative Journalism in Pakistan: Issues and Opportunities. *International Journal of Contemporary Issues in Social Sciences*, 3(1), 742-755. <http://ijciss.org/index.php/ijciss/article/view/361>
- Rabbani, K., Mehmood, M. A., & Areej, A. (2024). Speech act of flaming: A pragmatic analysis of Twitter trolling in Pakistan. *Discourse & Society*, 09579265231222589. <https://doi.org/10.1177/09579265231222589>
- Saleem, A. (2024). The political economy of television news in Pakistan. In *Global Journalism in Comparative Perspective* (pp. 27-39). Routledge.
- Saleem, S. (2024). Colonial Sense and Religious Sensibility: Understanding Injury and the Body of Nation in Censored Literature in South Asia. *Political Theology*, 1-20. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1462317X.2024.2304447>
- Saxena, A. (2024). Digital Media Content: Policies, Constitutions and Laws Across Countries. In *Handbook of Digital Journalism: Perspectives from South Asia* (pp. 529-544). Singapore: Springer Nature Singapore. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-99-6675-2_45
- Siddique, H., Farooqi, U., & Sanaullah, I. (2024). Framing Civil-Military Relations: A Content Analysis of Pakistani Print Media from 2008 to 2018. *Remittances Review*, 9(2), 1313-1339. <https://remittancesreview.com/menu-script/index.php/remittances/article/view/1605>
- Sohail, R. B. (2024). Analyzing the Portrayal of Political Leadership in Leading Pakistani News Channels: A Critical Analysis. *Journalism, Politics and Society*, 2(01), 69-86. <https://doi.org/10.63067/0fj42m94>
- Syed, A. F., Atta, A., Naqvi, U. L., Nazeer, I., & Anwar, S. (2023). Cybercrimes and print media: A critical discourse analysis of news reporting in Pakistan. *Central European Management Journal*, 31(1), 703- 721.