

Received: 11 November 2022 Accepted: 28 March, 2023

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.33182/rr.v8i4.184>

GOVERNMENT IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF MULTICULTURAL EDUCATION

Supsiloi¹, Badaruddin², Rizabuana Ismail³, Dara Aisyah⁴,

Abstract

Multicultural education is an important factor in creating harmony in areas where identity conflicts may occur. Multicultural education teaches tolerance to students. Therefore, its implementation requires a good strategy. Therefore, this study describes the strategy of implementing multicultural education in the city of Medan. The data collection method used in this study is qualitative with a case study approach. Data collection methods were conducted through observations, interviews, and documentary studies related to multicultural education strategies. Survey informants included the Medan City Education Office, curriculum experts, teachers, and students. The survey results show that the multicultural education of the city of Medan is based on aspects of implementation in schools that do not yet have special regional guidelines, either in the form of a governor's decree or a mayor's decree in the general curriculum. Schools are then given the freedom to define school characteristics through the school curriculum development team.

Keywords: *Government, Implementation, Multicultural Education*

Introduction

The discourse of multicultural education is often discussed in every circle, from political, religious, social, and cultural circles, and especially among educational thinkers (Tricahyono, 2020). This is based on the fact that there are still ethnic, social, and cultural conflicts that often arise amid a pluralistic society. Real evidence of rampant riots and conflicts shows that our education has failed in creating awareness of the importance of multiculturalism (Yunus, 2014). So research on multicultural education needs to continue to be developed because there are still many unresolved problems (Khairuddin, 2018; Asmuri, 2018). The issues of multicultural education will be of particular interest to focus on implementing or advocating as well as truly "multicultural" education (Sleeter & Grant, 1987). For example, how a curriculum is developed to create balance in a multicultural life. Multicultural education is important given to children or students, because multicultural education provides multicultural competence (Gardner, 1993 ; Sutiah et al., 2021).

Through multicultural education from an early age, children should be able to accept and understand cultural differences (PS et al., 2022). Multicultural education can help children better

¹ Faculty of Social and Political Science, Universitas Sumatera Utara, Medan, Indonesia **Email:** Supsiloi@unimed.ac.id

² Faculty of Social and Political Science, Universitas Sumatera Utara, Medan, Indonesia

³ Faculty of Social and Political Science, Universitas Sumatera Utara, Medan, Indonesia

⁴ Faculty of Social and Political Science, Universitas Sumatera Utara, Medan, Indonesia

understand the importance of diversity and become more tolerant of it (Purba, 2019). The importance of multicultural education is because this system can be an alternative means of solving identity conflicts (Puspita, 2013). Because national education is the foundation of providing non-discriminatory education, upholding human rights, religious values, and national pluralism, this means that education in Indonesia must carry messages based on multicultural education (Kallang, 2017 Amin et al., 2021). The city of Medan is an area with a very heterogeneous population. To build the city of Medan, the idea of implementing multicultural education is needed to avoid conflict. This multicultural education process can also be started in school.

Multicultural education in schools should not only be fair to students of different religions, races, ethnicities, and cultures, but should be supported by both written and hidden curriculums, must be implemented comprehensively (Banks, 2007). Therefore, the Ministry of National Education of the Republic of Indonesia must adopt multicultural education to be applied in school education from primary to the final level (Wahyuandari, 2014). Multicultural education must be included in the curriculum, and its implementation can be done as an extracurricular lesson or become part of the curriculum as a separate and independent subject (Suparlan, 2002).

The application of multicultural education in the learning system requires teachers who also understand the concept of multiculturalism. The teacher's role in teaching multicultural education is not only simple but also must be able to instil values such as democracy, humanism, and pluralism (Masamah, 2016). The importance of developing a multicultural education curriculum by involving stakeholders, especially to foster a sense of unity in diversity. The teacher is a very dominant determining factor in general education because the teacher plays a role in the learning process, where the learning process is the core of the overall educational process that aims to change children's behavior (Kirom, 2017).

LITERATURE REVIEW

According to (Yaqin, 2005), multicultural education strategies have evolved in Europe, the United States, and other developed countries. This strategy is the development of cross-cultural studies and multiculturalism. In its development, this study became a specialized study of multicultural education, initially aimed at helping large numbers of people address the issue of new immigrants. Multicultural education has the potential to enhance the knowledge base on how educational policies and practices influence the learning experience of all students (Grant & Tate, 1995).

The term "multicultural education" can be used at both a descriptive and normative level to describe educational issues and problems related to multicultural societies. It also includes an understanding of the considerations of educational policies and strategies in a multicultural society. After creating the expected changes in policy, leaders must use intercultural

communication skills to communicate the vision of multicultural education (Ozturgut, 2011). According to Rosyada (2014), multicultural education is still very diverse, and there is no agreement on whether multicultural education connotes education about cultural diversity or education to form an attitude of respect for cultural diversity. Kaman to Sunarto in Rosyada (2014) explained that multicultural education is usually defined as education for cultural diversity in society, and sometimes it is also interpreted as education that offers various models of cultural diversity in society, and sometimes it is also interpreted as education to foster student attitudes to appreciate cultural diversity.

According to Paulo Freire of Arifudin (2007), education can create a social order that praises social fame only through the wealth and prosperity experienced. This process must be carried out through a multicultural education process, an education that pays serious attention to the development of education for all and the development of a tolerant attitude (Azra, 2003 ; Amal et al., 2022). Therefore, multicultural education is defined in this context as an educational process that gives children of all nations the same, without discrimination based on ethnic, cultural, or religious differences. The increased diversity that students bring to the classroom causes a lot of confusion about how, what, and to whom (Rhoads, 1995).

Increasing cultural diversity means that many educators need to recognize and expand their understanding of multicultural education, especially in public schools (Nieto, 2000 ; Purba et al., 2018). With a very long history of immigration of people from different cultural groups, the need for multicultural education and acceptance of diversity is becoming more and more urgent. Therefore, the success or failure of multicultural education depends on the effective preparation of teachers (Smith, 2009). In this way, it helps students and all citizens to play a good role in society and acquire the attitudes, knowledge, and skills needed to create a moral society.

RESEARCH METHOD

The facts gathered on this look used a qualitative technique with a case study approach. According to Bogdan and Taylor, qualitative research is a research method that produces descriptive facts in the shape of written or spoken phrases from human beings and observable behavior (Moleong, 2012). This is strengthened through the announcement by Craswell (2014) that qualitative studies are defined relatively to offer a theoretical basis. The concept of these studies is as a manual, reference, manual, or manual in order that the studies' attention is in accordance with the statistics on the ground. In addition, the concept additionally serves as a framework for the evaluation of study results.

The basis for using qualitative research methods is that this study wants to understand more deeply the portrait of the implementation of multicultural education in the city of Medan, considering the condition of the multicultural community of Medan City, which is the uniqueness

and local advantage of Medan City as a miniature multicultural society in Indonesia. The informants in this study consisted of the Head of the Medan City Education Office, curriculum experts, teachers, and students. The informants above were determined using a purposive technique, where the number and specifications of the informants in this study were considered representative, and they had provided complete and representative information as needed for research purposes. Therefore, the data sources in this study are divided into two, namely primary data and secondary data.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Result

The implementation of multicultural education can provide an introduction to students to respect each other so that disintegration will not occur (Arifin, 2012). The goal of multicultural education is to help educators minimize diversity-related issues and make the most of their education (Banks, 2008). Diversity must be a potential for integration and keep it away from the potential for national disintegration. Based on the central government program related to the 2013 curriculum, indirectly every school is required to implement multicultural education. So that all fields of study are required to implement multicultural education by the provisions of the 2013 curriculum. Every subject teacher can integrate multicultural education into the subjects they teach. Each subject must be subject to the core competencies that have been formulated. Core competencies are not to be taught but are formed through learning (Hasanah, 2019). In other words, all fields of study that are taught and learned in the class must contribute to the formation of core competencies.

As stated by one of the curriculum experts from the State Islamic University of North Sumatra (UINSU), who stated, "Ideally, multicultural education is contained in the learning process. Therefore, all teachers in subjects are required to integrate multicultural education into the learning process." Moreover, in Curriculum 13, it is clear that the second core competence is social competence, which concerns the competence of cooperation, tolerance, democracy, and so on, all of which are within the scope of learning about multiculturalism. "

Likewise, a statement from a curriculum expert from the State University of Medan (UNIMED) stated, "If you want to place multiculturalism as a discourse in education in Indonesia, including in the city of Medan, it is necessary to design multicultural education in the curriculum." The most important thing is that multicultural education is designed into the curriculum, not westernism, because multicultural generics in Indonesia have existed since ancient times, namely in the motto *Bhineka Tunggal Ika*, which means "different but still one."

Furthermore, the informant stated that "Basically, the curriculum is built on a philosophical basis, and the context of our curriculum (education in Indonesia) is more inclined to the knowledge

paradigm, and the K-13 curriculum (currently applicable) is a competency-based curriculum, namely Core Competencies (KI) and Basic Competencies (KD). The Core Competencies (KI) consist of 4 KI, namely KI-1 (regarding religious attitudes), KI-2 (regarding social attitudes), KI-3 (regarding knowledge) and KI-4 (regarding skills). Especially for KI-2, it contains multicultural elements, namely social attitudes (such as cooperation, cooperation, and so on). However, it is a shame that in reality, the teacher is not directed in a multicultural-based learning process."

Integrating multicultural education into the school curriculum is a preventive measure that can be implemented. Therefore, educational institutions (primary and secondary education units) in a multicultural society must integrate multicultural education into the school curriculum. With regard to the integration of multicultural education into the curriculum in schools, it is very dependent on the regulations set by the central level (ministry of education) and the regional level (provincial and district/city). For the Medan City area, regional regulations concerning the integration of multicultural education into the curriculum greatly admire the Governor's Regulation (Pergub) and also the Mayor's Regulation (PerWal). As stated in the interview conducted by the researcher at the education office of Medan City, "with regard to the multicultural education curriculum, it is very dependent on the regulations set by the Central Government and then by the Governor's Regulation (PerGub) and Mayor's Regulation (PerWal). Regulations from the central level to PerGub and PerWal are the umbrella for policy. For the Medan City Education Office, the regulations that govern the integration of multicultural education into the curriculum have not been strengthened. This is due to the absence of intervention from the central government to the provinces and districts to make rules in the form of strict regulations regarding the integration of multicultural education into the school curriculum.

Likewise, the data disclosed by one of the research informants, who is a curriculum expert from Akhmad Dahlan University (UAD) Yogyakarta, emphasized that "the implementation of multicultural education can provide students with an introduction to other cultures so that a pluralist attitude will be maintained in students, such as mutual respect, respect, tolerance, and others so that disintegration will not occur." Diversity must be a potential for integration and keep it away from the potential for national disintegration. Ideally, education should teach multiculturalism. This is realized because of the diversity among the school community, the community, and the world. Where this diversity is "the gift of God," it cannot be avoided. That is why education and culture are words that are closely related to one another. So, the multicultural curriculum is an urgent matter to be developed in the world of education in Indonesia, including the city of Medan. To achieve this, the teacher's role in preparing students to become part of the community at the local, regional, and global levels is very decisive in integrating multicultural education.

DISCUSSION

The implementation of multicultural education in schools is very dependent on the regulations set by the central level (ministry of education) and the regional level (provincial and district/city). It would be ideal if there was a policy of the Medan City Education Office regarding multicultural education, but no such policy was found. Of course, there will be elaboration in the multicultural education curriculum if there is no regulation on multicultural education in the city of Medan. Regulations from the central level to PerGub and PerWal are the umbrella for policy. For the Medan City Education Office, there is no specific stipulation regarding the implementation of multicultural education into the curriculum. This is because there is no intervention from the central government to the provincial and city districts to make regulations in the form of strict regulations regarding the implementation of multicultural education into the curriculum. school or still be maintained.

The city of Medan, as one of the cities, should be able to apply multicultural education in educational units through integration into the curriculum. because, through the existing curriculum, students will follow the rules at school (Desky, 2017). Regional regulations that require the integration of multicultural education can be carried out as part of curriculum development. Because the curriculum cannot be separated from the conditions in which students are located, the community can be used as a learning resource that is packaged in the curriculum. Regarding the development of the school curriculum, based on the results, it is returned to the school. Each school, in developing its school curriculum, is given arrangements to determine what curriculum will be applied in the school, which can later be used as a characteristic of the school in question.

Based on the findings in the field, each school has a curriculum development tool consisting of the principal, vice principal in the field of curriculum, and teachers. So, what multicultural education curriculum will be applied by schools is very important in curriculum development tools in schools. In this case, the Medan City Education Office only ratifies it, while it is applied in each school's school. The implementation of multicultural education in educational units, including in the city of Medan, can reinforce to students the importance of mutual respect, respecting cultural diversity, ethnicity, religion, ethnicity, race, and differences in economic, educational, and socio-cultural levels, so that conflicts are socially resolved early (Halimah, 2017 ; Ampera et al., 2020).

Based on the description above, it can be said that the importance of multicultural education should be applied to educational units, especially in Medan City. Because the formation of a healthy multicultural Indonesian society can be done just like that or by trial and error, it must be done systematically, programmed, and integrated, and even needs acceleration (Azra, 2007). One

of the important strategies in implementing it is through the implementation of multicultural education, which is held in all educational institutions, both formal and non-formal (Munadlir, 2016). Education in the context of a pluralistic society such as the people of Medan is one of the most effective means to give birth to those who have views that can make diversity a part that must be appreciated constructively (Ibrahim, 2013). This is because education is systemic with a fairly even distribution. Therefore, education is a fairly effective means to achieve this goal (Fathonah, 2020 ; Ingias et al., 2022).

Based on an interview with the Medan City Education Office, which stated that multicultural education learning in junior high school (SMP) education units in the city of Medan still depended on teachers in the field of study. Although in this case, multicultural education is in several sub-themes of subjects that are almost close to it, such as citizenship education, social sciences, and religion. Multicultural education in the learning process at educational units in the city of Medan is very dependent on teacher learning; therefore, teachers must be creative in designing learning. is the design through the use of learning models that integrate multicultural education, such as discussion models, or contextual models by including examples. It is completely left to the teacher to integrate multicultural education into learning. However, in this case, it was found that there was no special training or workshop for teachers, thus giving rise to multiple interpretations among teachers in integrating this multicultural education into learning.

Curriculum experts explain that in the learning process, teachers do not only deliver material but also try to instil multicultural values. The subject matter must also be delivered in a way that is truly accessible and understandable by students so that multicultural messages and values can enter and grow into each student (Bukhori, 2018). Multicultural values in education are expected to shape the attitudes of students to be able to accept and appreciate the various kinds of differences that exist around them, both in terms of ethnicity, race, religion, language, culture, social class, gender, age, and ability (Santika, 2020). Multicultural education is seen as a learning and teaching approach based on democratic values, which are cultural pluralism (Ibrahim, 2013). Multicultural education is committed to achieving quality education and developing curricula that build an understanding of groups and address these practices (Bennett, 1986).

The 2013 curriculum, however does cover the way children interact, not directly on multicultural education. So teachers and other educators must meet the needs of children for any material related to multiculturalism. Because in the field, there is no direction from the government at the central to regional levels on how to implement multicultural education in the learning process. Therefore, it is necessary to formulate a regional regulation (Perda) which incorporates multicultural education in subjects and is contained as a curriculum development in educational units in the city of Medan. The application of multicultural education in educational units in the

city of Medan is the best solution for the people of the city of Medan who have a pluralistic community character.

Therefore, there should be a strategy for the Medan city government to make local regulations regarding the integration of multicultural education into the school curriculum. Through multicultural-based education, students' attitudes and mindsets will be more open to understanding and appreciating diversity. Because education is the most appropriate vehicle for building multicultural awareness (Palipung, 2016). An understanding of multicultural education in the field of education can be implemented through an integrated curriculum in subjects. Five things that are very important in developing multiculturalism are beliefs about students, curriculum content and materials, instructional approaches, educational settings, and teacher education (Ladson-Billings, 1994). Multicultural education can train and build students' character to be capable because it is democratic, humanist, and plural in their environment (Munadlir, 2016). However, until now there has been no confirmation that strengthens either from the central government or provincial and district governments regarding the integration of multicultural education into the curriculum, either integrated with the curriculum or as a stand-alone field of study.

CONCLUSION

Based on data analysis, it can be said that there is no application of multicultural education in the city of Medan based on official policies from the Ministry of Education. In addition, there are also no special regional policies, both governor's regulations and mayor's regulations. Schools, in this case, are given the autonomy to determine the characteristics of the school through the curriculum development team. Viewed from the aspect of an application in schools, multicultural education is taught through several fields of study that approach multicultural education materials, namely Social Science lessons, Citizenship Education, and Religious Studies.

REFERENCE

- Asmuri, A. (2017). Multicultural education (study of the national education system and Islamic religious education). *POTENSLA: Jurnal Kependidikan Islam*, 2(1), 25-44.
- Amin, Z., Burhanuddin, B., Shadiq, T. F., & Purba, A. S. (2021). How The Choice of Academic Majors and Students' Future Achievements According to The Talent Path. *Nazbruma: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 4(3), 672-684.
- Al Arifin, Akhmad Hidayatullah. " Implementation of Multicultural Education in Educational Practice in Indonesia." *Jurnal Pembangunan Pendidikan: Fondasi dan Aplikasi* 1.1 (2012).
- Ampera, D., Hufad, A., Amal, B. K., Purba, A. S., & Arqam, M. L. (2020). Memorization Learning Outcomes Of Vocational High School Students In Learning Basic Patterns. *International Journal of Advanced Science and Technology*, 29(06), 1104-1111.

- Azra, Azyumardi. (2007). *Multicultural Education: Rebuilding Indonesia Bhinneka Tunggal Ika. Paper presented at the 3rd Indonesian Anthropology International symposium. Denpasar: UNUD Cultural Studies.*
- Arifudin, I. (2007). The urgency of implementing multicultural education in schools. *INSANLA: Jurnal Pemikiran Alternatif Kependidikan*, 12(2), 220-233.
- Amal, B. K., Rambe, T., Ampera, D., Purba, A. S., Ridho, H., & Daud, D. (2022). Parents' perceptions of children's education and parents' attitudes towards the education of fishermen's children. *Jurnal Pendidikan, Sains Sosial, dan Agama*, 8(1), 85-97.
- Azra, Azyumardi, 2003. Multicultural Education; Rebuilding Indonesia Bhineka Tunggal Ika. *Jurnal Tsaqafah, Vol. I, No. 2.*
- Banks. James A (2007). *Educating citizens in a multicultural society.* New York: Teacher College Press.
- Banks, J. A. (2008). An introduction to multicultural education.
- Bennett, C. I. (1986). *Comprehensive multicultural education: Theory and practice.* Boston: Allyn and Bacon.
- Bukhori, I. (2018). The values of multicultural education in Aswaja and NU subjects for SMP/MTs students. *At-Ta'lim: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 4(1), 35-56.
- Desky, A. F., Pujiati, P., Simanihuruk, M., Ismail, R., & Manurung, R. (2017). Language as a Status Symbol of Power in Social Interactions at a Multicultural School in the City of Medan. *Jurnal Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik*, 20(3), 264-277.
- Creswell, J. W. (2014). *A concise introduction to mixed methods research.* SAGE publications.
- Fathonah, S. (2020). Reinforcing the Vision of Islamic Education as Multicultural Education. *Edukasia: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran*, 1(1), 85-96.
- Gardner, Howard. 1993. Multiple Intelligence: The Theory in Practice A Reader. USA: Basic Book.
- Grant, C. A., & Tate, W. F. (1995). Multicultural Education through the Lens of the Multicultural Education Research Literature.
- Halimah, S., & Nuryadi, M. H. (2017). Strengthening Multicultural Values in Learning Pancasila and Citizenship Education (Study on Class X Students of SMA Negeri 2 Karanganyar). *Educitizen*, 2(1).
- Hasanah, U. (2018). Implementation of Multicultural Education in Shaping Early Childhood Character. *Golden Age: Jurnal Pendidikan Anak Usia Dini*, 2(1).
- Ibrahim, R. (2015). Multicultural Education: Understanding, Principles, and Their Relevance to the Goals of Islamic Education. *Addin*, 7(1).
- Ingias, F. T., Ampera, D., Fariyah, F., Amal, B. K., & Purba, A. S. (2022). Implementation of Teaching Practitioners In Improving The Quality of Learning and Implementing The Curriculum Merdeka Belajar. *Jurnal Studi Guru dan Pembelajaran*, 5(2), 157-169.
- Khairuddin, A. (2018). Epistemology of multicultural education in Indonesia. *IJTIMAIYAH Jurnal Ilmu Sosial dan Budaya*, 2(1).

- Kallang, A. (2019). Relationship between Education and Law in Human Welfare. *Ekspose: Jurnal Penelitian Hukum dan Pendidikan*, 16(2), 402-410.
- Kirom, A. (2017). The role of teachers and students in the multicultural-based learning process. *Jurnal Al-Murabbi*, 3(1), 69-80.
- Ladson-Billings, G. (1994). What we can learn from multicultural education research. *Educational leadership*, 51(8), 22-26.
- Masamah, U., & Zamhari, M. (2017). The Role of Teachers in Developing Multicultural Awareness Education in Indonesia. *Quality*, 4(2), 262-279.
- Moleong, Lexy J. (2012). *Qualitative Research Methodology*. Bandung : PT Remaja Rosdakarya
- Munadlir, A. (2016). School strategy in multicultural education. *Jurnal Pendidikan Sekolah Dasar Ahmad Dahlan*, 2(2), 114-130.
- Nieto, S. (2000). *Affirming diversity: The sociopolitical context of multicultural education* (3rd ed.). New York: Longman.
- Ozturgut, O. (2011). Understanding multicultural education. *Current issues in education*, 14(2).
- PS, A. M. B. K., Aliyah, N. D., Azizah, M., Amal, B. K., & Purba, A. S. (2022). Deradicalization Model Through Islamic Education Curriculum in Indonesia, Spain, And Nigeria. *resmilitaris*, 12(2), 428-439.
- Palipung, N. (2016). Implementation of multicultural education in inclusive schools in Taman Muda, Ibu Pawaiyatan Taman, Yogyakarta students. *Spektrum Analisis Kebijakan Pendidikan*, 5(5), 558-566.
- Purba, A. S., Hufad, A. C. H. M. A. D., Amal, B. K., Ahyani, A. H. M. A. D., & Sutarni, N. A. N. I. (2018). Development of games instruction within plant growth concept. *Journal of Engineering Science and Technology (JESTEC)*, 13, 1-10.
- Puspita, W. A. (2013). Multiculturalism in Early Childhood Education. *Jurnal Ilmiah Visi*, 8(2), 144-152.
- Purba, A. S., Malihah, E., & Hufad, A. (2019). The implementation of multicultural education in senior high schools in Medan. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute (BIRCI-Journal): Humanities and Social Sciences*, 2(3), 226-233.
- Rhoads, R. A. (1995). Critical multiculturalism, border knowledge, and the canon: Implications for general education and the academy. *The Journal of General Education*, 44(4), 256-273.
- Rosyada, Dede. 2014. Multicultural Education in Indonesia A Conceptual View. *Jurnal Sosio Didaktika*, Vol. 1 No. 1.
- Sutiah, S., Kholid, A., Purba, A. S., & Slamet, S. (2021). Improving the competitiveness of Islamic higher education: Study approaches to development of human resource competencies (HR). *Review of International Geographical Education*, 11(3), 477-493.

- Suparlan, Parsudi. (2002). *Multiculturalism. Semi-Workshop Papers for ISBD Lecturers Ditjen Dikti*: Yogyakarta.
- Smith, E. B. (2009). Approaches to multicultural education in pre-service teacher education: philosophical frameworks and models for Teaching. *Multicultural Education*.
- Sumiharsono, Rudy dan Hisbiyatul Hasanah. 2017. *Learning Media: Compulsory Reading Books for Lecturers, Teachers and Prospective Educators*. Jawa Timur: CV Pustaka Abadi.
- Sleeter, C., & Grant, C. (1987). An analysis of multicultural education in the United States. *Harvard educational review*, 57(4), 421-445.
- Santika, I. W. E. (2020). Character education in online learning. *Indonesian Values and Character Education Journal*, 3(1), 8-19.
- Tricahyono, D., Sariyatun, S., & Ediyono, S. (2020). Analysis of Critical Discourse on Multicultural Education and Values Education in High School History Textbooks. *SOCLA: Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial*, 17(1), 1-10.
- Wahyuandari, W., & Rahmawati, D. (2014). Multicultural Education (Case Study In Junior High School (SLTP) In Tulungagung). *Jurnal Bonorowo*, 2(1), 71-91.
- Yunus, F. M. (2014). Religious conflicts in Indonesia, problems and solutions. *Substantia: Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Ushuluddin*, 16(2), 217-228.
- Yaqin, Ainul M. (2005). *Multicultural Education Cross – Cultural Understanding for Democracy and Justice*. Yogyakarta: Pilar Media